DSS ✓
edoc —
letter.hw 907018.2006-11-27.CRAUpdate.pdf

CONESTOGA-ROVERS
& ASSOCIATES

651 Colby Drive, Waterloo, Ontario, Canada N2V 1C2
Telephone: 519·884·0510 Facsimile: 519·884·0525
www.CRAworld.com

November 17, 2006

Reference No. 017948

Mr. David Szymanski
New York State Department of Environmental Conservation
270 Michigan Avenue
Buffalo, NY 14203-2999

Dear Mr. Szymanski:

Re: Update Report
Ellison Bronze Site, Falconer, New York

This report presents the post remedial monitoring activities that have been performed for the Ellison Bronze Site in Falconer, New York for 2006. All of the activities performed have been completed in accordance with terms specified in the Order on Consent that was signed by Ellison Bronze and the NYSDEC on June 13, 1995.

GENERAL BACKGROUND

The site was remediated in 1995. The remedy consisted of the excavation and stabilization of approximately 1,400 cubic yards of lead contaminated foundry waste and 60 cubic yards of copper contaminated stream sediment. The materials were stabilized with Portland cement and tested using aggressive TCLP methods to confirm that the stabilized material would not leach any deleterious material. All data were reviewed and approved by the NYSDEC prior to backfilling.

Following backfilling of all stabilized materials, the area was paved to further eliminate the potential for contact with the stabilized materials.

Commencing in November of 1996, and continuing through November of 2006, groundwater samples have been collected from the three on Site wells in accordance with the long term monitoring plan. As agreed in a letter dated June 13, 2001, the NYSDEC has approved a reduction in the groundwater monitoring program in that samples from the three wells need only be collected once, every two years. Consequently, the next sampling event, should one be necessary, will occur late in the year 2008.

The purpose of this report is to provide an update on the status of the Site and its condition. This report covers the period January 2006 through December 2006.

POST STABILIZATION GROUNDWATER MONITORING

Groundwater sampling was performed on October 19, 2006 in accordance with the Long-Term Monitoring Plan contained in the "Soil/Sediment Stabilization Summary Report, Dowcraft Corporation, Ellison Bronze Site, Falconer, New York". Three monitoring wells were sampled (ESI-1R, ESI-2, and ESI-3).

Purging was continued until sediment-free water was obtained. Sediment-free water was determined by both visual observation and the use of a field turbidemeter. Turbidity values of less than 2 NTU were obtained at all three sampling locations.

Each well was sampled for lead, barium, manganese, and iron. The samples were placed in a cooler with ice and shipped to the STL Laboratory in Pittsburgh PA on October 19, 2006 following chain-of custody procedures. Table 1 presents the 2006 analytical results for the groundwater samples.

The 2006 analytical results for each parameter were below New York State Class GA Groundwater Standards at all locations with the exception of manganese at location ESI-1R. The reported level of manganese, however, is similar to those detected during all previous sampling events (1996 through 2004) and is less than those reported at the same location during the Remedial Investigation in 1992. A historical summary for all sampling rounds is provided in Table 2.

SITE INSPECTIONS

Personnel from Ellison Bronze have been performing the site inspections of the remediated area to confirm that the area is environmentally sound.

During this year's inspections, the monitoring wells, grassed areas, and stream banks were all found to be in good condition. Some minor repairs to the paved areas were made following the April inspection. These paved areas were in good condition again during the October 2006 inspection. Copies of the 2006 inspection reports are attached.

As stated in the June 13, 2001 letter from the NYSDEC, annual inspections of these areas will continue.

CONCLUSIONS & RECOMMENDATIONS

The groundwater concentrations from the samples collected in 2006 are the same as they have been for the past 11 years. All of the data show that the lead contaminated materials have been suitably addressed from an environmental perspective and that no leaching of lead has or will occur. Consequently, it is concluded that the remediation of this Site has been successfully completed and that there is no need for continued groundwater monitoring of this Site. In fact, there has never been any identified lead contamination present in the groundwater beneath this Site nor in the soils beneath the waste materials that were stabilized, including the time period before the remediation was completed. It is therefore recommended that this groundwater monitoring program be terminated.

The request to terminate this monitoring program was first requested by CRA in 2005. A response from the NYSDEC was provided on January 31, 2005 stating that the monitoring must continue regardless of the facts or the Site conditions. CRA requested clarification of which regulation states that groundwater monitoring must be a component of an operation, maintenance, and monitoring plan (see letter of October 27, 2005). A phone response from NYSDEC stated that regulation 360.2.15.k4 stipulates this requirement.

CRA has reviewed this regulation and believes that it is within the NYSDEC project manager's discretion as to the need for groundwater monitoring. The regulation states:

> *"Annual baseline and quarterly routine monitoring must be performed on groundwater, surface water, and leachate samples for a minimum period of five years. After this five-year period, the permittee may request that the department modify the sampling and analysis requirements."*

The minimum five years of sampling has been completed. Lead is the compound for which the remediation was undertaken. Lead was not detected in 19 of the 24 groundwater samples for which it was analyzed over the past 11 years. In the remaining 5 samples, the detected concentration was either at the detection limit or estimated to be present at a concentration below the detection limit. Given the uncertainty of detections at or below the detection limit, the facts are clear; lead is not present in the groundwater beneath this Site at a level that poses any adverse risk and may not even be present at all.

In addition to the absence of lead in the groundwater beneath this Site at this time:

- Lead was not present in the groundwater before the remediation took place;
- Lead was not present above the soil criteria in the soils directly beneath the fill material that was stabilized to control the lead (before the remediation took place); and

- Lead was not leachable from the stabilized soils at the time the stabilization was performed and this was conducted using an acidified TCLP procedure that reduces the pH to produce a very aggressive leaching potential that does not naturally exist at the Site.

Given that lead was never present in the groundwater before the remediation took place, it will certainly not be present now that the material has been stabilized with Portland cement. Eleven years of testing confirms that this will not happen. Therefore, there is no need to continue monitoring the groundwater at this Site. Again it is recommended that this groundwater monitoring program be terminated. Your anticipated cooperation in correcting this matter is greatly appreciated.

Should there be any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me at 519-884-0510 or Kim Peterson of Ellison Bronze at 716-665-6522.

Yours truly,

CONESTOGA-ROVERS & ASSOCIATES

James K. Kay

JKK/cb/3
Encl.

c.c.: Kim Peterson
Dave Tyran

TABLE 1
ANALYTICAL RESULTS SUMMARY
ELLISON BRONZE
FALCONER, NEW YORK
OCTOBER 2006

	Location:	*ESI-1R*	*ESI-2*	*ESI-3*
	Sample:	*WG-17948-101906-001*	*WG-17948-101906-002*	*WG-17948-101906-003*
	Sample Date:	*10/19/2006*	*10/19/2006*	*10/19/2006*
Parameters	*Units*			
Metals				
Barium	µg/L	128 J	159 J	189 J
Iron	µg/L	100 U	32.2 J	100 U
Lead	µg/L	3.0 U	3.0 U	3.0 U
Manganese	µg/L	339	68.9	4.6 J

Notes:

J	Estimated.
U	Non-detect at associated value.

TABLE 2

HISTORICAL ANALYTICAL RESULTS SUMMARY
GROUNDWATER SAMPLING
LONG-TERM MONITORING PROGRAM
DOWCRAFT CORPORATION, ELLISON BRONZE SITE
FALCONER, NEW YORK

	Class GA Groundwater Standard (mg/L)	*ESI-1R*							
		1996	*1997*	*1998*	*1999*	*2000*	*2002*	*2004*	*2006*
Total Lead	0.025	ND (0.005)/ND (0.005)	ND (0.002)/ND (0.002)	ND (0.003)/ND (0.003)	ND (0.002)/ND (0.002)	ND (0.005)/ND (0.005)	ND (0.005)/ND (0.005)	0.00197J/0.00242J	ND (0.003)
Total Barium	1.0	0.17/0.16	0.177/0.174	0.207/0.206	0.232/0.230	0.252/0.259	0.201/0.202	0.151/0.148	0.128J
Total Iron	0.3	0.15/0.14	ND (0.06)/ND (0.06)	0.115/0.153	0.222/0.175	0.132/0.114	0.0998J/0.103J	ND (0.2)/ ND (0.2)	ND (0.10)
Total Manganese	0.3	2.4/2.4	2.45/2.41	1.81/1.81	2.13/2.13	3.08/3.13	2.78/2.78	1.390/1.350	0.339

TABLE 2

HISTORICAL ANALYTICAL RESULTS SUMMARY
GROUNDWATER SAMPLING
LONG-TERM MONITORING PROGRAM
DOWCRAFT CORPORATION, ELLISON BRONZE SITE
FALCONER, NEW YORK

	Class GA Groundwater Standard (mg/L)	*ESI-2*							
		1996	*1997*	*1998*	*1999*	*2000*	*2002*	*2004*	*2006*
Total Lead	0.025	ND (0.005)	0.003	ND (0.003)	ND (0.002)	ND (0.005)	ND (0.005)	ND (0.005)	ND (0.003)
Total Barium	1.0	0.15	0.159	0.144	0.156	0.153	0.184	0.173	0.159J
Total Iron	0.3*	0.09	ND (0.06)	ND (0.06)	0.062	ND (0.050)	ND (0.020)	ND (0.20)	0.032J
Total Manganese	0.3*	0.17	0.086	0.02	0.058	0.030	0.0808	0.033	0.069

TABLE 2

HISTORICAL ANALYTICAL RESULTS SUMMARY
GROUNDWATER SAMPLING
LONG-TERM MONITORING PROGRAM
DOWCRAFT CORPORATION, ELLISON BRONZE SITE
FALCONER, NEW YORK

	Class GA Groundwater Standard (mg/L)	*ESI-3*							
		1996	*1997*	*1998*	*1999*	*2000*	*2002*	*2004*	*2006*
Total Lead	0.025	ND (0.005)	0.003	ND (0.003)	ND (0.002)	ND (0.005)	0.00165J	0.00212J	ND (0.003)
Total Barium	1.0	0.17	0.136	0.113	0.086	0.077	0.0799	0.247	0.189J
Total Iron	0.3*	0.06	ND (0.06)	ND (0.06)	0.079	0.074	ND(0.200)	ND (0.20)	ND (0.10)
Total Manganese	0.3*	0.007	ND (0.01)	ND (0.01)	0.005	ND (0.010)	0.0033J	ND (0.010)	0.005J

TABLE C.1

SEMI-ANNUAL INSPECTION CHECKLIST
LONG-TERM MONITORING PLAN
ELLISON BRONZE SITE
FALCONER, NEW YORK

Date: 4-5-06

Inspection Personnel: William Haskins

Inspection Item		*Condition*		
		Good	*Satisfactory*	*Poor-Repairs Required*
A.	Paved Areas	☐	☐	☑
B.	Grassed Areas	☑	☐	☐
C.	Stream Banks	☑	☐	☐
D.	Monitoring Wells	☑	☐	☐

Comments: _____

TABLE C.1

SEMI-ANNUAL INSPECTION CHECKLIST
LONG-TERM MONITORING PLAN
ELLISON BRONZE SITE
FALCONER, NEW YORK

Date: 10-4-06

Inspection Personnel: William Haskins

Inspection Item		*Condition*		
		Good	*Satisfactory*	*Poor-Repairs Required*
A.	Paved Areas	☑	☐	☐
B.	Grassed Areas	☑	☐	☐
C.	Stream Banks	☑	☐	☐
D.	Monitoring Wells	☑	☐	☐

Comments: PAVED AREAS REPAIRED