

NEW YORK STATE DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL CONSERVATION

Division of Environmental Remediation

625 Broadway, 11th Floor, Albany, NY 12233-7020

P: (518)402-9543 | F: (518)402-9547

www.dec.ny.gov

8/08/2023

Nathan Marton
Commissioner Of Public Works, Parks & Streets
City of Buffalo DPW
502 City Hall
65 Niagara Square
Buffalo, NY 14202
mfinn@ch.ci.buffalo.ny.us

Re: Reminder Notice: Site Management Periodic Review Report and IC/EC Certification Submittal

Site Name: Trinidad Park

Site No.: B00083

Site Address: 237 Kensington Avenue
Buffalo (C), NY 14214

Dear Nathan Marton:

This letter serves as a reminder that sites in active Site Management (SM) require the submittal of a periodic progress report. This report, referred to as the Periodic Review Report (PRR), must document the implementation of, and compliance with, site-specific SM requirements. Section 6.3(b) of DER-10 *Technical Guidance for Site Investigation and Remediation* (available online at <http://www.dec.ny.gov/regulations/67386.html>) provides guidance regarding the information that must be included in the PRR. Further, if the site is comprised of multiple parcels, then you as the Certifying Party must arrange to submit one PRR for all parcels that comprise the site. The PRR must be received by the Department no later than **October 26, 2023**. Guidance on the content of a PRR is enclosed.

Site Management is defined in regulation (6 NYCRR 375-1.2(at)) and in Chapter 6 of DER-10. Depending on when the remedial program for your site was completed, SM may be governed by multiple documents (e.g., Operation, Maintenance, and Monitoring Plan; Soil Management Plan) or one comprehensive Site Management Plan.

A Site Management Plan (SMP) may contain one or all of the following elements, as applicable to the site: a plan to maintain institutional controls and/or engineering controls ("IC/EC Plan"); a plan for monitoring the performance and effectiveness of the selected remedy ("Monitoring Plan"); and/or a plan for the operation and maintenance of the selected remedy ("O&M Plan"). Additionally, the technical requirements for SM are stated in the decision document (e.g., Record of Decision) and, in some cases, the legal agreement directing the remediation of the site (e.g., order on consent, voluntary agreement, etc.).

When you submit the PRR (by the due date above), include the enclosed forms documenting that all SM requirements are being met. The Institutional Controls (ICs) portion of the form (Box 6) must be signed by you or your designated representative. If you cannot certify that all SM requirements are being met, you must submit a Corrective Measures Work Plan that identifies the actions to be taken to restore compliance. The work plan must include a schedule to be approved by the Department. The Periodic Review process will not be considered complete until all necessary corrective measures are completed and all required controls are certified. Instructions for completing the certifications are enclosed.



Department of
Environmental
Conservation

All site-related documents and data, including the PRR, must be submitted in electronic format to the Department of Environmental Conservation. The required format for documents is an Adobe PDF file with optical character recognition and no password protection. Data must be submitted as an electronic data deliverable (EDD) according to the instructions on the following webpage:

<https://www.dec.ny.gov/chemical/62440.html>

Documents may be submitted to the project manager either through electronic mail or by using the Department's file transfer service at the following webpage:

<https://fts.dec.state.ny.us/fts/>

The Department will not approve the PRR unless all documents and data generated in support of the PRR have been submitted using the required formats and protocols.

You may contact Matthew King, the Project Manager, at 518-402-7383 or matthew.king@dec.ny.gov with any questions or concerns about the site. Please notify the project manager before conducting inspections or field work. You may also write to the project manager at the following address:

New York State Department of Environmental Conservation
Division of Environmental Remediation, BURE
625 Broadway

Albany, NY 12233-7017

Enclosures

PRR General Guidance
Certification Form Instructions
Certification Forms

ec: w/ enclosures

City Of Buffalo - mfinn@ch.ci.buffalo.ny.us

ec: w/ enclosures

Matthew King, Project Manager

Andrea Caprio, Section Chief

Andrea Caprio, Hazardous Waste Remediation Supervisor, Region 9

City of Buffalo - Jason Paananen - jpaananen@ch.ci.buffalo.ny.us

City of Buffalo - Andrew Rabb - arabb@ch.ci.buffalo.ny.us

Enclosure 1

Certification Instructions

I. Verification of Site Details (Box 1 and Box 2):

Answer the three questions in the Verification of Site Details Section. The Owner and/or Qualified Environmental Professional (QEP) may include handwritten changes and/or other supporting documentation, as necessary.

II. Certification of Institutional Controls/ Engineering Controls (IC/ECs)(Boxes 3, 4, and 5)

1.1.1. Review the listed IC/ECs, confirming that all existing controls are listed, and that all existing controls are still applicable. If there is a control that is no longer applicable the Owner / Remedial Party should petition the Department separately to request approval to remove the control.

2. In Box 5, complete certifications for all Plan components, as applicable, by checking the corresponding checkbox.

3. If you cannot certify "YES" for each Control listed in Box 3 & Box 4, sign and date the form in Box 5. Attach supporting documentation that explains why the **Certification** cannot be rendered, as well as a plan of proposed corrective measures, and an associated schedule for completing the corrective measures. Note that this **Certification** form must be submitted even if an IC or EC cannot be certified; however, the certification process will not be considered complete until corrective action is completed.

If the Department concurs with the explanation, the proposed corrective measures, and the proposed schedule, a letter authorizing the implementation of those corrective measures will be issued by the Department's Project Manager. Once the corrective measures are complete, a new Periodic Review Report (with IC/EC Certification) must be submitted within 45 days to the Department. If the Department has any questions or concerns regarding the PRR and/or completion of the IC/EC Certification, the Project Manager will contact you.

III. IC/EC Certification by Signature (Box 6 and Box 7):

If you certified "YES" for each Control, please complete and sign the IC/EC Certifications page as follows:

- For the Institutional Controls on the use of the property, the certification statement in Box 6 shall be completed and may be made by the property owner or designated representative.
- For the Engineering Controls, the certification statement in Box 7 must be completed by a Professional Engineer or Qualified Environmental Professional, as noted on the form.



Enclosure 2
NEW YORK STATE DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL CONSERVATION
Site Management Periodic Review Report Notice
Institutional and Engineering Controls Certification Form



Site Details	Box 1
Site No. B00083	
Site Name Trinidad Park	
Site Address: 237 Kensington Avenue Zip Code: 14214	
City/Town: Buffalo (C)	
County: Erie	
Site Acreage: 3.690	
Reporting Period: September 26, 2020 to September 26, 2023	
	YES NO
1. Is the information above correct?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
If NO, include handwritten above or on a separate sheet.	
2. Has some or all of the site property been sold, subdivided, merged, or undergone a tax map amendment during this Reporting Period?	<input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
3. Has there been any change of use at the site during this Reporting Period (see 6NYCRR 375-1.11(d))?	<input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
4. Have any federal, state, and/or local permits (e.g., building, discharge) been issued for or at the property during this Reporting Period?	<input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
If you answered YES to questions 2 thru 4, include documentation or evidence that documentation has been previously submitted with this certification form.	
5. Is the site currently undergoing development?	<input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

	Box 2
	YES NO
6. Is the current site use consistent with the use(s) listed below? Restricted-Residential, Commercial, and Industrial	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>
7. Are all ICs in place and functioning as designed?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>

**IF THE ANSWER TO EITHER QUESTION 6 OR 7 IS NO, sign and date below and
DO NOT COMPLETE THE REST OF THIS FORM. Otherwise continue.**

A Corrective Measures Work Plan must be submitted along with this form to address these issues.

Signature of Owner, Remedial Party or Designated Representative

Date

Description of Institutional Controls

Parcel

OwnerInstitutional Control

089.67-4-20

City of Buffalo

Ground Water Use Restriction
Soil Management Plan
Landuse Restriction

In accordance with the Record of Decision dated March 31, 2003, the following institutional controls are in place:

- i) Deed restrictions on the site restricting its use for public recreation only and prohibiting the use of the groundwater as a potable or process water source;
- ii) Deed restrictions include the requirement that the soils management procedures (Appendix D of the February 2003 Site Investigation Remedial Alternatives Report) are followed, to address any future excavation or soil disturbance activities that may occur on the site; and
- iii) The City of Buffalo will submit an Triennial Report to the NYSDEC certifying that these institutional controls are still in place and are still effective.

Description of Engineering Controls

None Required

Not Applicable/No EC's

Periodic Review Report (PRR) Certification Statements

1. I certify by checking "YES" below that:

- a) the Periodic Review report and all attachments were prepared under the direction of, and reviewed by, the party making the Engineering Control certification;
- b) to the best of my knowledge and belief, the work and conclusions described in this certification are in accordance with the requirements of the site remedial program, and generally accepted engineering practices; and the information presented is accurate and complete.

YES NO

X —

2. For each Engineering control listed in Box 4, I certify by checking "YES" below that all of the following statements are true:

- (a) The Engineering Control(s) employed at this site is unchanged since the date that the Control was put in-place, or was last approved by the Department;
- (b) nothing has occurred that would impair the ability of such Control, to protect public health and the environment;
- (c) access to the site will continue to be provided to the Department, to evaluate the remedy, including access to evaluate the continued maintenance of this Control;
- (d) nothing has occurred that would constitute a violation or failure to comply with the Site Management Plan for this Control; and
- (e) if a financial assurance mechanism is required by the oversight document for the site, the mechanism remains valid and sufficient for its intended purpose established in the document.

YES NO

X —

**IF THE ANSWER TO QUESTION 2 IS NO, sign and date below and
DO NOT COMPLETE THE REST OF THIS FORM. Otherwise continue.**

A Corrective Measures Work Plan must be submitted along with this form to address these issues.

Signature of Owner, Remedial Party or Designated Representative

Date

IC CERTIFICATIONS
SITE NO. B00083

Box 6


SITE OWNER OR DESIGNATED REPRESENTATIVE SIGNATURE

I certify that all information and statements in Boxes 1,2, and 3 are true. I understand that a false statement made herein is punishable as a Class "A" misdemeanor, pursuant to Section 210.45 of the Penal Law.

I Jason Paananen at 901 City Hall, 65 Niagara Sq, Buffalo, NY 14202
print name print business address

am certifying as Owner (Owner or Remedial Party)

for the Site named in the Site Details Section of this form.


Signature of Owner, Remedial Party, or Designated Representative
Rendering Certification

10/24/2023
Date

Enclosure 3
Periodic Review Report (PRR) General Guidance

- I. Executive Summary: (1/2-page or less)
 - A. Provide a brief summary of site, nature and extent of contamination, and remedial history.
 - B. Effectiveness of the Remedial Program - Provide overall conclusions regarding;
 1. progress made during the reporting period toward meeting the remedial objectives for the site
 2. the ultimate ability of the remedial program to achieve the remedial objectives for the site.
 - C. Compliance
 1. Identify any areas of non-compliance regarding the major elements of the Site Management Plan (SMP, i.e., the Institutional/Engineering Control (IC/EC) Plan, the Monitoring Plan, and the Operation & Maintenance (O&M) Plan).
 2. Propose steps to be taken and a schedule to correct any areas of non-compliance.
 - D. Recommendations
 1. recommend whether any changes to the SMP are needed
 2. recommend any changes to the frequency for submittal of PRRs (increase, decrease)
 3. recommend whether the requirements for discontinuing site management have been met.
- II. Site Overview (one page or less)
 - A. Describe the site location, boundaries (figure), significant features, surrounding area, and the nature and extent of contamination prior to site remediation.
 - B. Describe the chronology of the main features of the remedial program for the site, the components of the selected remedy, cleanup goals, site closure criteria, and any significant changes to the selected remedy that have been made since remedy selection.
- III. Evaluate Remedy Performance, Effectiveness, and Protectiveness

Using tables, graphs, charts and bulleted text to the extent practicable, describe the effectiveness of the remedy in achieving the remedial goals for the site. Base findings, recommendations, and conclusions on objective data. Evaluations should be presented simply and concisely.
- IV. IC/EC Plan Compliance Report (if applicable)
 - A. IC/EC Requirements and Compliance
 1. Describe each control, its objective, and how performance of the control is evaluated.
 2. Summarize the status of each goal (whether it is fully in place and its effectiveness).
 3. Corrective Measures: describe steps proposed to address any deficiencies in ICECs.
 4. Conclusions and recommendations for changes.
 - B. IC/EC Certification
 1. The certification must be complete (even if there are IC/EC deficiencies), and certified by the appropriate party as set forth in a Department-approved certification form(s).
- V. Monitoring Plan Compliance Report (if applicable)
 - A. Components of the Monitoring Plan (tabular presentations preferred) - Describe the requirements of the monitoring plan by media (i.e., soil, groundwater, sediment, etc.) and by any remedial technologies being used at the site.
 - B. Summary of Monitoring Completed During Reporting Period - Describe the monitoring tasks actually completed during this PRR reporting period. Tables and/or figures should be used to show all data.
 - C. Comparisons with Remedial Objectives - Compare the results of all monitoring with the remedial objectives for the site. Include trend analyses where possible.
 - D. Monitoring Deficiencies - Describe any ways in which monitoring did not fully comply with the monitoring plan.
 - E. Conclusions and Recommendations for Changes - Provide overall conclusions regarding the monitoring completed and the resulting evaluations regarding remedial effectiveness.
- VI. Operation & Maintenance (O&M) Plan Compliance Report (if applicable)
 - A. Components of O&M Plan - Describe the requirements of the O&M plan including required activities, frequencies, recordkeeping, etc.
 - B. Summary of O&M Completed During Reporting Period - Describe the O&M tasks actually completed during this PRR reporting period.
 - C. Evaluation of Remedial Systems - Based upon the results of the O&M activities completed, evaluated

the ability of each component of the remedy subject to O&M requirements to perform as designed/expected.

- D. O&M Deficiencies - Identify any deficiencies in complying with the O&M plan during this PRR reporting period.
- E. Conclusions and Recommendations for Improvements - Provide an overall conclusion regarding O&M for the site and identify any suggested improvements requiring changes in the O&M Plan.

VII. Overall PRR Conclusions and Recommendations

- A. Compliance with SMP - For each component of the SMP (i.e., IC/EC, monitoring, O&M), summarize;
 - 1. whether all requirements of each plan were met during the reporting period
 - 2. any requirements not met
 - 3. proposed plans and a schedule for coming into full compliance.
- B. Performance and Effectiveness of the Remedy - Based upon your evaluation of the components of the SMP, form conclusions about the performance of each component and the ability of the remedy to achieve the remedial objectives for the site.
- C. Future PRR Submittals
 - 1. Recommend, with supporting justification, whether the frequency of the submittal of PRRs should be changed (either increased or decreased).
 - 2. If the requirements for site closure have been achieved, contact the Departments Project Manager for the site to determine what, if any, additional documentation is needed to support a decision to discontinue site management.

VIII. Additional Guidance

Additional guidance regarding the preparation and submittal of an acceptable PRR can be obtained from the Departments Project Manager for the site.