

DRAFT

PHASE I ENVIRONMENTAL SITE ASSESSMENT

**210 DOUGLASS STREET
BROOKLYN, NEW YORK 11217**

Prepared for

**MIDWOOD MANAGEMENT
450 PARK AVENUE
SUITE 505
NEW YORK, NY**

Prepared by

**ASSESSMENT RESOURCES & TECHNOLOGIES, INC.
111 JOHN STREET. SUITE 538
NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10038
(212) 785-0266 FAX (212) 785-0234**

October 14, 2013

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
1.0 EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	3
2.0 INTRODUCTION	5
2.1 PURPOSE	5
2.2 DETAILED SCOPE OF SERVICES	5
2.3 SIGNIFICANT ASSUMPTIONS	6
2.4 LIMITATIONS AND EXCEPTIONS.....	6
2.5 SPECIAL TERMS AND CONDITIONS	7
2.6 USER RELIANCE	7
3.1 LOCATION AND LEGAL DESCRIPTION.....	8
3.2 SITE AND VICINITY CHARACTERISTICS	8
3.3 CURRENT USES OF THE SITE	8
3.4 DESCRIPTIONS OF STRUCTURES, ROADS, OTHER IMPROVEMENTS ON THE SITE	8
3.4.1 General Description of the Structures	8
3.4.2 Ingress/Egress and Parking Areas	8
3.4.3 Potable Water Supply.....	8
3.4.4 Heating/Cooling Systems and Electric Power	8
3.4.5 Sewage Disposal.....	8
3.4.6 Stormwater Management	9
3.5 CURRENT USES OF ADJOINING PROPERTIES	9
4.1 TITLE RECORDS	10
4.2 ENVIRONMENTAL LIENS OR ACTIVITY AND USE LIMITATIONS	10
4.3 SPECIALIZED KNOWLEDGE	10
4.4 COMMONLY KNOWN OR REASONABLY ASCERTAINABLE INFORMATION.....	10
4.5 VALUATION REDUCTION FOR ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES.....	11
4.6 OWNER, PROPERTY MANAGER, AND OCCUPANT INFORMATION	12
4.7 REASON FOR PERFORMING THE ESA	12
5.0 RECORDS REVIEW.....	13
5.1 STANDARD ENVIRONMENTAL RECORD SOURCES (FEDERAL AND STATE REGULATORY AGENCY DATABASE REVIEW)13	
5.2 ADDITIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL RECORDS (LOCAL REGULATORY AGENCIES)	17
5.2.1 New York City Department of Buildings	17
5.2.2 New York City Fire Department	17
5.2.3 New York City Department of Planning and New York City Department of Finance.....	17
5.3 PHYSICAL SETTING.....	17
5.3.1 Geological and Physical Characteristics	17
5.3.2 Topography	18
5.3.3 Hydrology	18
5.4 PAST USES OF THE SITE	19
5.5 PAST USES OF ADJOINING PROPERTIES.....	19
6.0 SITE RECONNAISSANCE	21
6.1 METHODOLOGY AND LIMITING CONDITIONS	21
6.2 GENERAL SITE SETTING.....	21
6.3 HAZARDOUS SUBSTANCES IN CONNECTION WITH IDENTIFIED USES	21
6.4 HAZARDOUS SUBSTANCE CONTAINERS AND UNIDENTIFIED SUBSTANCE CONTAINERS	21
6.5 STORAGE TANKS.....	21
6.6 INDICATIONS OF POLYCHLORINATED BIPHENYLS (PCBs).....	21
6.7 INDICATION OF SOLID WASTE DISPOSAL.....	21
6.8 OTHER ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES	21
6.9 RADON	22
7.0 INTERVIEWS.....	23
8.0 FINDINGS.....	24
9.0 OPINIONS AND CONCLUSIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS	25

10.0	DEVIATIONS.....	26
11.0	ADDITIONAL SERVICES	27
12.0	REFERENCES	28
13.0	SIGNATURES OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROFESSIONALS	29
14.0	QUALIFICATIONS OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROFESSIONALS	30

APPENDICES

Appendix A: Site Location Map and Site Plan

Appendix B: Site Photographs

Appendix C: State and Federal Regulatory Agency Database Report

Appendix D: Historical Fire Insurance Maps and City Directories

Appendix E: USEPA PRP List January 2013

Appendix F: ESA Questionnaire

1.0 EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Assessment Resources & Technologies, Inc. ("ART") has performed a Phase I Environmental Site Assessment (ESA) of the property located at 210 Douglass Street, Brooklyn, New York (the "Site"). The purpose of the ESA was to perform environmental due diligence prior to the proposed acquisition and redevelopment of the Site by the Client. ART conducted the ESA in conformance with the scope and limitations of ASTM Practice E 1527-05. Any exceptions to, or deletions from, this practice are described in Sections 2.0 of this report.

The Site contains one (1) two-story warehouse/industrial building with a footprint of approximately 17,500 square feet. The remainder of the Site contains a paved parking lot and alley along the Gowanus Canal bulkhead (The Gowanus Canal borders the east side of the Site). The total size of the Site is estimated at 24,850 square feet. The Site is located adjacent to the west side of the Gowanus Canal in an area that has been used for various industrial purposes and for historical coal gasification facilities. The Gowanus Canal is identified on the federal National Priorities List as a Superfund site. The current Site improvements were constructed in 1954 and the Site building historically contained a plastic parts manufacturing operation and a cardboard products factory with printing operations for an extended period of time. Prior to 1954 the Site contained a coal yard and the northern section of the Site (parking lot) was part of an electrical parts manufacturing facility. Currently, the Site building contains a television show production studio. Properties to the west of the Site (hydraulic upgradient area) were also used for manufacturing operations.

The Site parking lot is identified as "Parcel VIII" in a remedial investigation report produced to address the nature and extent of the contamination caused by a former manufactured gas plant (MGP) historically located east of the Site across the Gowanus Canal. This prior subsurface study of Parcel VIII (Site parking lot) identified coal tar-related and possibly petroleum-related soil contamination. Based upon ART's review of publicly available documents and User-supplied documents, it appears that the Site parking lot was selected for investigation solely because the Site owner allowed access. Based on a review of publicly available and User-supplied subsurface investigation reports, the most severe impact by these substances appears to be located at depths below approximately 20-25 feet below ground surface (bgs) and area localized to areas along the Gowanus Canal bulkhead within the Site.

Water table groundwater samples collected from monitoring wells located in the Degraw Street sidewalk adjacent to the southeast corner of the Site building show only low-to-trace contaminant concentrations by volatile organic compounds (VOCs). However, other groundwater quality data in these reports do show low levels of contamination by perchloroethylene (PCE) at monitoring wells located at hydraulic upgradient positions relative to the Site. In addition, a State Spills incident included in the environmental regulatory agency database report acquired by ART indicates that elevated PCE and benzene concentrations were detected in groundwater at 198 Douglass Street, which contains a building located directly adjacent to the Site. This reported condition raises the potential of groundwater contamination at the Site by these volatile organic compounds, which appears to be originating from hydraulic upgradient sources. In addition, ART cannot entirely exclude a possible on-site contribution to this potential condition due to its long history of industrial use. This State Spills incident also raises the possibility of a vapor intrusion condition at the Site.

ART was also present at the Site to observe one soil boring installed at the Site parking lot for geotechnical investigation purposes. A mud rotary drill rig operated and directed by others installed a soil boring to 47 feet below ground surface (bgs). Due to the drilling method, GFE was unable to specifically determine depth to the water table but it is assumed to be with ten

feet bgs. Field evidence of soil and groundwater contamination was identified in the form of measurable volatile organic vapors by a photoionization detector. Two-foot split-spoon soil samples were collected every five feet by the drilling contractor and GFE noted increasing physical evidence of contamination with depth. The 40 to 42-foot soil sample exhibited evidence of what appeared to be free-phase heavy grade petroleum contamination and PID readings were recorded at 500 parts per million (ppm), which is considered a high-level response. Little or no apparent evidence of coal tar was observed in the soil boring (coal tar is the byproduct of manufactured gas plants, also known as coal gasification). However, the method drilling used for the geotechnical investigation was not conducive to a thorough evaluation of soil conditions. Historical fire insurance maps and regulatory agency databases reviewed by GFE identified no manufactured gas plants (MGPs) at the Site or at adjoining properties. The nearest former MGP facility was located east-southeast of the Site across the Gowanus Canal. However, much of what was observed by ART (and identified in a remedial investigation report prepared by others for the Gowanus Canal NPL) could be attributed to past contaminant releases into the Gowanus Canal by the nearby MGP and possibly other industrial operation historically located along the canal.

The findings of this ESA represent a Recognized Environmental Condition. The potential exists for elevated levels of volatile organic compounds in soil and groundwater at the Site which could be a contributing source of this possible condition. Further, documented contamination by coal tar and possibly less dense petroleum exists under the Site near the Gowanus Canal bulkhead. This condition worsens with depth beginning at approximately 20-25 feet bgs. Further, numerous PRPs have been identified for the Gowanus Canal NPL including former and current owners/occupants of adjoining properties. Publicly available documents reviewed by ART do not apparently identify prior occupants and/or owners of the Site as PRPs but this finding is not conclusive.

ART recommends that a subsurface investigation be conducted to determine if elevated concentrations of volatile organic compounds exist in soil and/or groundwater at the Site. The study should be designed to determine if the Site is a source (or a contributing source) of such a condition if discovered. Further, the scope of the subsurface study should include evaluation of deeper soil quality to determine if the deeper soil contamination extends in a westerly direction under the Site.

2.0 INTRODUCTION

This report summarizes the results of a Phase I Environmental Site Assessment (ESA) conducted at the Site, which is located at 210 Douglass Street, Brooklyn, New York 11217. The Site is located in an area that has historically been used for a variety of industrial and commercial purposes. (see Figure 1-Site Location Map).

Mr. Frank Galdun, ART Project Manager, conducted a reconnaissance of the Site on September 20, 2013. ART was accompanied during the reconnaissance by Mr. Chris Hayes, the tenant representative. The weather was clear and sunny with no limitations to visibility or Site access. ART returned to the Site on September 25, 2013 to observe installation of one geotechnical investigation soil boring into the parking lot of the Site using a mud rotary drill rig. This boring was installed a by ERM, an engineering firm retained by the Client.

2.1 Purpose

The purpose of the ESA described in this report was to identify, to the extent feasible pursuant to the processes described herein, the presence of Recognized Environmental Conditions (RECs) as defined in the ASTM Standard Practice for Environmental Site Assessments, E 1527-05. A REC is defined pursuant to ASTM as:

"The presence or likely presence of any hazardous substances or petroleum products on a property under conditions that indicate an existing release, a past release, or a material threat of a release of any hazardous substances or petroleum products into structures on the property or into the ground, groundwater or surface water of the property. The term includes hazardous substances or petroleum products even under conditions in compliance with laws. The term is not intended to include de minimis conditions that generally do not present a material risk of harm to public health or the environment and that generally would not be the subject of an enforcement action if brought to the attention of appropriate governmental agencies. Conditions determined to be de minimis are not recognized environmental conditions."

2.2 Detailed Scope of Services

ART evaluated the prior use and history of the Site through a review of available public records, historical property maps, and prior reports. Federal, state and local regulatory agency information was reviewed to establish the past usage and activities at the Site, and to allow an overview of the potential for contamination by hazardous materials and/or petroleum products. ART reviewed federal and state regulatory agency databases to determine if any properties identified in these documents are located within specified radii of the Site. Search radii are specified in ASTM E 1527-05.

Specifically, the following agency records were reviewed:

1. Local building permit agency, finance department, fire department, and planning department as available.
2. State underground storage tank and leaking underground storage tank databases; state Voluntary Cleanup Program database; state Brownfields database; state Hazardous Waste Site database; state hazardous material and petroleum product spills database; state solid waste landfill listing.

3. Federal CERCLIS listing; National Priority (Superfund) listing; RCRA large and small quantity generator listing, RCRIS treatment, storage and disposal facilities listing; federal CORRACTS; federal ERNS;

ART visually surveyed the Site to determine activities or conditions that present the potential for contamination. A visual review for the following was conducted:

1. Stored materials;
2. Process materials and wastes;
3. Tanks and containment systems;
4. Construction materials;
5. Evidence of cesspools and/or treatment systems;
6. Evidence of underground storage tanks or other subsurface structures;
7. Utilities, including sewage, drainage, and electrical systems;
8. Evidence of improper hazardous or regulated material storage, handling or disposal activities;
9. Other recognized environmental conditions.

ART prepared this ESA Report, which includes the following:

1. Executive Summary;
2. Site description and history;
3. Identification of recognized environmental conditions and a discussion of the document review;
4. Recommendations, if warranted, for characterization and/or remediation of recognized environmental conditions and/or further investigation;
5. A topographic map consistent with U.S. Geological Survey 7.5 minute quadrangle which includes the Site location;
6. Photographs, historical maps, site plan, prior reports, and other supporting documents.

2.3 Significant Assumptions

ART has assumed that the Site is proposed for acquisition and possible redevelopment. ART also assumes that this ESA will be used as guidance to assess the potential presence of adverse environmental conditions.

2.4 Limitations and Exceptions

This ESA report describes specific assessment purposes, methods and findings particular to the Site. Only information that became available over the period of study is presented. Changes in the conditions concerning the Site may occur with time as a result of natural or human activities.

ART has prepared the ESA in general conformance with the scope and limitations of the ASTM E 1527-05 and with the contract scope of work, using reasonable efforts to attempt to identify areas of potential liability associated with RECs at the Site.

The scope of the ESA is intended to aid in evaluating whether additional investigation would be prudent. The tasks encompassing the ESA are not exhaustive or definitive. The tasks were conducted as an initial screening to provide a reasonable level of investigation for identifying recognized environmental conditions (RECs) within the scope, time limitations, and budgetary

constraints of a Phase I ESA and additional investigation in connection with environmental due diligence activities. This ESA is both less rigorous than, and different from, an environmental audit and is not intended to address regulatory compliance. The opinions and conclusions expressed in this study have been based strictly on the results of these contracted services. No conclusions are stated or implied concerning the suitability of the Site for its eventual use.

The conclusions in this report were based solely on a visual review and on readily available records, interviews and other secondary sources. ART has made no independent investigation of the accuracy of these secondary sources and has assumed them to be accurate and complete. ART does not warrant the accuracy or completeness of information provided by secondary sources (ART has no reason to believe that the secondary sources provided or acquired during this study contain intentionally false or misleading information). ART does not warrant that contamination that may exist on the Site has been discovered, that the Site is suitable for any particular purpose or that the Site is clean or free of liability. Any cost estimates are based on general comparisons with past projects of similar scope and size, and actual cost or design-phase estimates may vary substantially from these estimates.

2.5 Special Terms and Conditions

This ESA was performed in general conformance with the scope and limitations of the ASTM E 1527-05.

2.6 User Reliance

This report has been prepared for the exclusive use of Midwood Management (the "Client" and also the "User"). ART acknowledges that the Client and its successors, assigns, representatives, attorneys, lenders, insurers may rely on this report with respect to acquiring, insuring or financing the Site. ART makes no representations to parties other than the Client.

3.0 SITE DESCRIPTION

3.1 Location and Legal Description

According to local regulatory agency records researched by ART, the Site address is 210 Douglass Street, Brooklyn, New York 11217. The New York City Department of Buildings (NYCDOB) also identifies the Site as the following addresses: 206 to 210 Douglass Street; and 479 to 495 Degraw Street. The Site is bordered to the north by Douglass Street, to the south by Degraw Street and to the east by the Gowanus Canal. The New York City Department of Buildings identifies the Site as Block 417, Lot 5214. A Site Location Map and Site Plan are provided as Appendix A.

3.2 Site and Vicinity Characteristics

The Site is rectangular in shape with a northerly extension containing a narrow parking lot. This parking lot is connected to Douglass Street by an alley located between the Site building and the Gowanus Canal. The Site building lies adjacent to Degraw Street at the south side of the Site. All properties adjoining the Site are in use and contain various former industrial buildings, a water pumping station operated by the New York City Department of Environmental Protection (NYCDEP), an oil delivery company vehicle stockyard/repair shop and a parking lot. Photographs of the Site and surrounding properties are included in Appendix B.

3.3 Current Uses of the Site

The Site is currently used as a television production studio.

3.4 Descriptions of Structures, Roads, Other Improvements on the Site

3.4.1 General Description of the Structures

The Site building footprint is approximately 17,500 square feet. Construction design consists of steel frame with masonry perimeter walls and a poured concrete floor slab. No basement levels exist at the Site. Based on a review of historical fire insurance maps and NYCDOB records, the current Site improvements were constructed in 1954.

3.4.2 Ingress/Egress and Parking Areas

Pedestrian and vehicular access is from both Degraw Street and Douglass Street (see Site Sketch).

3.4.3 Potable Water Supply

Potable water is available to the Site from the municipal drinking water distribution system.

3.4.4 Heating/Cooling Systems and Electric Power

Electricity is supplied to the Site from the local power grid operated by the local utility company. Heating and cooling systems consist of rooftop package units. No heating oil-fueled systems exist at the Site.

3.4.5 Sewage Disposal

The Site has always been connected to the combined municipal sewer/stormwater system.

3.4.6 Stormwater Management

Stormwater flows down to east to the Gowanus Canal. Stormwater originating from the roof is piped to the combined municipal stormwater/sewer system.

3.5 Current Uses of Adjoining Properties

The following uses of adjoining properties were observed by ART on the day of the reconnaissance:

North: A NYCDEP municipal sewage pumping station and water flushing station is located north of the Site directly across Douglass Street and is currently being upgraded. The purpose of the water flushing station is to draw water from the East River by a subsurface tunnel for discharge to Gowanus Canal to prevent stagnation. This flushing operation is currently inactive during upgrade. Northwest of the Site also across Douglass Street is a plumbing contractor building (Vigilante Heating & Cooling, 195 Douglass Street).

South: Across Degraw Street to the south, a large open stockyard containing a fuel delivery and fuel delivery operation and delivery vehicle maintenance facility (Bayside Fuel, 276 to 285 Bond Street).

East: The Gowanus Canal (construction of the canal completed in 1869).

West: West of the Site parking lot and north of the Site building is a single-story warehouse currently used to store fine art (198 Douglass Street). In addition, a small parking lot is located west of 198 Douglass Street and north of the Site building. Two industrial buildings (249 to 263 Bond Street) that currently contain apparent construction contractor offices are located farther to the west (see Site Sketch)

4.0 USER PROVIDED INFORMATION

4.1 Title Records

No title reports were provided to ART. However, ART did review the New York City Automated City Register Information System (ACRIS), which does list prior deed transfers and mortgage holders. ACRIS records for the Site date back to 1992 and list “Magnifico Enterprises,” and “Vince Realty Corporation,” as “Party 1” and “Party 2” between 1992 and 1999 (the Commissioner of Finance the City of New York is identified as “Party 1” in 1995).

ACRIS identifies Eastern Effects, Inc. as Party 1 and Bank of the West is identified as Party 2 in the 2012 ACRIS entry. The document types listed in this entry is “Initial UCC1.” The UCC1 means there is a security agreement which a bank or lending agency files with the New York County Clerk’s Office to indicate that if the borrower sells a property before borrower has repaid the loan in full, the new property owner will owe the balance of the loan to the lender. If the borrower defaults on a payment, the UCC1 authorizes the lender to seize the property. The meaning of this information is unclear to ART as the owner of record at the Site appears to be Magnifico Enterprises, Inc.

4.2 Environmental Liens or Activity and Use Limitations

None of the local regulatory agency records reviewed by ART indicated that environmental liens have been placed against the Site. In addition, a lien search report acquired by ART from Environmental Data Resources, Inc. (EDR) for each of the Site addresses listed no environmental liens against the Site. Neither the User nor the results of this study disclosed any activity and use limitations imposed by regulators on the Site.

4.3 Specialized Knowledge

ART has no specialized knowledge of the Site aside from information obtained from subsurface investigation reports initiated by regulatory agencies in connection with the Gowanus Canal NPL site.

4.4 Commonly Known or Reasonably Ascertainable Information

ART received and reviewed numerous publicly available documents pertaining to the Gowanus Canal NPL site, including prior subsurface investigations conducted to establish the nature and extent of contamination at certain parcels adjacent to the Gowanus Canal.

Of note, ART reviewed a report titled *Final Remedial Investigation Report, Fulton Municipal Works Manufactured Gas Plant (MGP) Site, Brooklyn, New York* dated July 2012 by GEI Consultants (the “Final RIR”). The Final RIR is addressed to National Grid, a local utility that had acquired successor companies to the Fulton Municipal Gas Company, which formerly owned and operated the former Fulton Municipal Works MGP. This former facility is located at a cluster of properties east and southeast of the Site across the Gowanus Canal. National Grid is identified by USEPA as a responsible party for cleanup of the former Fulton Municipal Works MGP and possibly for addressing the Gowanus Canal contamination. The principal contaminants of concern identified in the Final RIR consist of coal tar containing polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs). The contaminant is typically found as a dense nonaqueous phase liquid (DNAPL).

The scope of the Final RIR included installation of a soil boring into the Site parking lot. The

Final RIR identifies the Site parking lot as “Parcel VIII,” and explained that selection of the Site parking lot was based solely due to ease of access as allowed by the current Site owner. The Final RIR did not indicate that the Site parking lot was a known or suspected source of contamination entering the Gowanus Canal.

According to the RIR, DNAPL was discovered in the boring installed into the Site parking lot at depths beginning at approximately 20-25 feet bgs and extending several tens of feet deeper. ART’s review of data concerning additional soil borings installed by the Final RIR along Degraw Street and Douglass Street show that the horizontal extent of the DNAPL appears to be limited to the areas adjacent to the Gowanus Canal Bulkhead. The Final RIR could not attribute this DNAPL to sources other than activities in the Gowanus Canal and the former MGP located east of the Site on the opposing side of the canal.

Several groundwater monitoring wells are located along Degraw Street and Douglass Street adjacent to (and near) the Site, some of which were installed by the Final RIR and other studies. Certain volatile organic compounds (VOCs) in the form of low levels of benzene, ethylbenzene and xylenes (“BTEX”) were detected in groundwater samples collected from these wells. In addition, low levels of perchloroethylene (PCE) were detected in a well located west of the Site (PCE appears to be detected in wells located nearer to the Site but this could not be confirmed with certainty due to the large volume of available data, the number of wells and the various entities that installed the wells at various times). It appears that much of the BTEX contamination in groundwater may be originating from the south-adjointing Bayside Fuel facility (this property was reportedly a former petroleum bulk storage and distribution facility). The Final RIR also concluded that the Bayside Fuel facility was the likely source of BTEX as well as PAHs associated with petroleum. The Final RIR stated that the petroleum-related contamination at Bayside Fuel is being addressed by the New York State Department of Environmental Conservation (NYSDEC), which is requiring further investigation and remediation of these conditions. The Final RIR identified little or no evidence of BTEX migration to the Site from the Bayside Fuel property. PCE was detected in groundwater as reported by the Final RIR. While the degree of contamination by this chlorinated VOC is considered low by ART, the detected concentrations do exceed applicable regulatory limits. The Final RIR indicated that the detected PCE originate from sources other than the former MGP.

Additional documents reviewed by ART include a list of potentially responsible parties (PRPs) formally contacted by USEPA requesting additional information on historical operations adjacent to the Gowanus Canal. This USEPA document is dated January 2013 and identifies the City of New York and National Grid as confirmed responsible parties for funding of the Gowanus Canal remediation. A firm identified as “Chemtura” also has contributed \$3.9 million as part of a bankruptcy agreement to resolve its liability for the Gowanus Canal contamination. ART’s review of the PRP list identified no entity with an apparent connection to the Site, but this finding should not be interpreted as conclusive in any way. One identified PRP (O-Z Gedney Co, LLC, Number 13 on the PRP list) formerly operated an electrical parts manufacturing operation for an extended period of time at buildings located west of the Site (including the current fine arts warehouse).

4.5 Valuation Reduction for Environmental Issues

No formal documented valuation reduction for environmental issues pertaining to the Site appears to exist. The intent of this ESA is to identify such issues for the User to determine the need for, and applicability of, valuation reduction, and to satisfy certain requirements for conducting environmental investigations by regulatory agencies. Based on the proximity of the Gowanus Canal, the documented presence of petroleum and possibly coal tar (although not apparently originating from the Site), the detected presence of VOCs in groundwater in monitoring wells

installed in sidewalks adjacent to the Site as documented by the RIR, ART believes that the potential exists for valuation reduction for environmental issues at the Site.

4.6 Owner, Property Manager, and Occupant Information

According to User-supplied information, the Site is owned and managed by Magnifico Enterprises. The occupant of the Site is Eastern Effects, Inc., which operates a television production studio at the Site.

4.7 Reason for Performing the ESA

The Client/User proposes to acquire and possibly develop the Site. This ESA was conducted to qualify for affirmative defense under CERCLA liability and to understand existing environmental risks.

5.0 RECORDS REVIEW

5.1 Standard Environmental Record Sources (Federal and State Regulatory Agency Database Review)

ART reviewed federal and state regulatory agency databases for the Site and surrounding properties. These records provide information on whether hazardous substances, wastes or petroleum products have been improperly handled, stored, or disposed of on or adjacent to, and thereby may have adversely impacted the environmental integrity of the Site.

ART completed the federal and state records review through a computer database search of facilities, which appear on a series of government lists. The EDR report lists those properties that are located within the ASTM-recommended radii of the Site. EDR also reports state and federal databases which are not included in the ASTM standard as well as some properties that are located beyond the ASTM-recommended radii. In addition, EDR reports properties that lack adequate address information to be definitively mapped (“unmapped sites”).

ART reviews the database report to identify and to locate facilities that potentially impact the Site based on information submitted to regulatory agencies. In some cases, the location information is not provided, is misleading or is incorrect. Therefore, ART conducted a walkover and windshield screen of an area approximately one-eighth mile in radius around the Site to identify and to locate facilities such as gasoline stations and dry cleaners, which may utilize significant quantities of hazardous substances or petroleum products. ART is thereby better able to establish the risk posed to the Site by the surrounding properties. Facilities that are located beyond the specified search radii are not discussed, as they are not considered potential environmental concerns due to their distances.

A summary of properties identified through the database review is provided in Table 5.1:

Table 5.1 – Summary of Federal and State Regulatory Agency Records Review*			
Federal or State List	Is Site on List?	Surrounding Area Search Radius *	Total Number Listed
1. National Priorities List (NPL or Federal Superfund Listing), includes proposed NPL and delisted NPL	No	1 mile	1
2. Federal Resource Conservation and Recovery Act (RCRA) Corrective Actions (CORRACTS)	No	1 mile	1
3. Federal Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation and Liability Information System (CERCLIS)	No	½ mile	1
4. CERCLIS “No Further Remedial Action Planned” (NFRAP)	No	Site and adjacent	0
5. Federal Resource Conservation and Recovery Information System - Treatment, Storage or Disposal Facilities (RCRIS-TSDF)	No	½ mile	0
6. Federal and/or State Institutional Control/Engineering Control Registry	No	Site and adjacent	0
7. RCRA registered small or large generators of hazardous waste (SQG/LQG)	No	Site and adjacent	1
8. Federal Emergency Response Notification System (ERNS)	Yes	Site	1
9. State Hazardous Waste Sites (SHWS)	No	1 mile	2
10. State Leaking Storage Tank Incident Reports (LTANKS)	No	½ mile	40
11. State Hazardous Material and Petroleum Product Spills (State Spills)	No	Site and adjacent	16
12. State Solid Waste Facilities/Landfill Sites (SWF/LF)	No	½ mile	9
13. State-Registered Underground Storage Tanks (USTs)	No	Site and adjacent	2
14. State Voluntary Cleanup Program Sites	No	½ mile	0
15. State Brownfields Sites	No	½ mile	3
* Other databases that are not included in the ASTM standard were reviewed by ART but are not included here as no properties or facilities were listed within the respective search radii.			

The Site is identified in the ERNS database. However, this incident consisted of a response to a report of floating “tar balls” in the Gowanus Canal adjacent to Douglass Street. Regulatory agency information in the database indicates that the bottom sediment in the canal was likely disturbed, causing the release of coal tar. There appears to be no connection between the Site and the ERNS incident in the Gowanus Canal.

The following narratives provide information concerning listed facilities and incidents that warrant further comment:

Federal National Priorities List (NPL, a./k./a., Superfund List)

The Gowanus Canal in its entirety is identified on the NPL. The state and federal regulatory agency database shows only the lower canal area near its discharge point to Gowanus Bay as the NPL-designated area (the Site is located near the head of the canal). However, ART’s review of publicly available information published by the USEPA shows that the entire canal is included within the NPL area. USEPA mechanisms for addressing conditions in the canal sediment and to pursue PRPs have been initiated. In addition, the Gowanus Canal is identified in the federal CERCLIS database and in the New York State Hazardous Waste Sites (SHWS) database. The sediment beneath the Gowanus Canal is contaminated by PAHs in the form of coal tar originating from former MGPs. In addition, other contaminants consisting of heavy metals, polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs) and pesticides have been identified in canal sediment at elevated concentrations. The contamination has also been attributed in part to long term sewage discharges into the canal by New York City, and by a long history of industrial activity at properties that line the canal.

Coal tar has been documented in deeper sediment beneath the parking lot at the Site but there appears to be no evidence that identifies the Site as a source of this material. However, it is clear subsurface soil quality that at least a minor section of the south side of the Site has been adversely affected by the impacted sediment beneath the canal and possibly by the historical MGP located east of the Site across the Gowanus Canal.

Federal CORRACTS

CORRACTS identifies those RCRA-regulated facilities where corrective action is required. One CORRACTS is listed within one mile of the Site and is identified as Patterson Chemical Co. Inc., 102 3rd Street, Brooklyn, New York, approximately 2,000 feet southwest of the Site. This facility was assigned a “low corrective action priority,” by regulators. Based on the distance of this property, ART concludes it is unlikely that this CORRACTS has the potential of adversely affecting the environmental integrity of the Site and no further investigation is recommended.

Federal RCRA Large Quantity and Small Quantity Hazardous Waste Generators (LQG/SQG)

One LQG is listed adjacent to the Site and is identified as NYCDEP Gowanus Canal Pumping Station, 201 Douglass Street, directly north of the Site across Douglass Street. This facility reportedly generates waste sodium hydroxide, which is listed as a corrosive e hazardous waste due to high pH. This facility is not identified in any of the remaining state or federal regulatory agency databases reviewed by ART. This hazardous waste activity is not considered by ART to be an area of environmental concern.

New York State Hazardous Waste Sites (SHWS)

Two SHWS are identified within a one-mile radius of the Site. The nearest of these listings is the east-adjointing Gowanus Canal, which is previously discussed in various sections of this report.

The second listed SHWS is identified as “K-Metropolitan MGP,” which is a historical MGP

located on the Gowanus Canal approximately 2,800 feet south-southwest of the Site. While there is evidence identifying this former facility as a contributor to the sediment contamination beneath the Gowanus Canal, the distance of this former facility from the Site makes it unlikely that it adversely affected the environmental integrity of the Site and no further investigation is recommended.

New York State Solid Waste Facilities/Landfill Facilities (SWF/LF)

Nine SWF/LFs are identified on the database within one-half mile of the Site. The nearest of these facilities is “Brooklyn Truck & Equipment,” 242 Nevins Street, Brooklyn, New York, located to the east of the Site across the Gowanus Canal. This facility is identified as “C&D processing,” in the database and reportedly receives concrete, soil and wood. During the reconnaissance, ART observed that this property contains a large shed-like structure that presumably contains construction and demolition debris. In addition, a large open stockyard is located directly north of this building and contains stored and parked commercial trucks. Prior reports and historical fire insurance maps reviewed by ART do not show that this property was formerly part of the nearby MGP. In addition, groundwater quality data obtained from monitoring wells installed by the Final RIR show only low levels of BTEX and PAHs, making it unlikely that this property adversely affected the environmental integrity of the Site (this property is identified as “Parcel VII” in the Final RIR).

A second SWF/LF is identified at 462-470 Baltic Street, approximately 625 feet north-northeast of the Site (listed as “Basin Haulage”). No violations of applicable regulations are reported at this facility and no hazardous material/petroleum product leaks or spills are listed. This former C&D processing facility is identified as “inactive” in the database. No hazardous material or petroleum product spills are reported and no violations of applicable regulations are identified in the database. Based on these findings and on the distance of this facility from the Site, ART concludes it is highly unlikely that it adversely affected Site soil or groundwater quality and no further investigation is recommended.

All of the remaining listed SWF/LFs are reportedly located at least 900 feet from the Site and all consist of either inactive or active solid waste transfer stations, or active or inactive metal scrap yards. These properties are located at sufficiently great enough distances to allow ART to conclude it is highly unlikely that these operations have adversely affected Site soil or groundwater quality and no further investigation is recommended.

New York State Leaking Storage Tanks (LTANKS) Database

A total of 40 LTANKS were reported within a one half-mile radius of the Site. The nearest of these incidents to the Site was reported at 238 Bond Street, which contains the New York City Housing Authority – Gowanus Housing Complex. This large parcel is located approximately 380 feet northwest of the Site. In 2005 NYSDEC received a report of a failed underground heating oil storage tank (UST) integrity test. Report details indicate that a gasket was repaired and a second integrity test “passed” the UST. NYSDEC has “closed” this LTANK case with a “no further action required” determination. Based on the distance of this property from the Site, ART believes it to be unlikely that the LTANK had adversely impacted Site soil or groundwater quality and no further investigation is recommended.

All remaining LTANKS are listed at least 400 feet from the Site making it highly unlikely that they have adversely impacted the environmental integrity of the Site.

New York State Hazardous Material/Petroleum Product Spills (State Spills)

16 State Spills were reported in close proximity of the Site. Eight of these incidents were

reported at the NYCDEP sewage pumping station north of the Site across Douglass Street. All of these incidents pertained to malfunctions of sewage pumps and sewage overflows into Gowanus Canal. These incidents have been formally “closed” with a “no further action required” determination by NYSDEC. USEPA has identified New York City as a PRP (and likely as a confirmed RP) for the contamination in Gowanus Canal due to long term discharges of sewage to the canal.

One of the State Spills incidents was reported at 198 Douglass Street, which is identified in the database as “Former O.Z. Electric & Manufacturing Company.” This former occupant is identified as a PRP by the USEPA for the Gowanus Canal NPL. The State Spills incident reportedly occurred in 2006 inside the fine arts warehouse adjacent to the west side of the Site parking lot. NYSDEC notations included in the database indicate that petroleum vapors were detected by occupants during construction work inside the building. Reportedly a soil boring was installed, a groundwater sample was collected for laboratory analysis, and elevated levels of benzene, perchloroethylene (PCE), and a “variety” of semi-volatile organic compounds were detected. This incident remains open and unresolved with NYSDEC, which reportedly was or is considering placing this property in the SHWS listing. ART believes it is likely that these substances were released either at the fine arts warehouse or other buildings to the west that were formerly occupied by O.Z. Electric & Manufacturing Company. Further, all of the buildings are located at a known hydraulic upgradient position relative to the Site and the information disclosed in this database is considered by ART to be a REC and a potential vapor intrusion condition at the Site.

Four State Spills are reported at “Bayside Fuel Company,” which is located at the large parcel to the south of the Site across Degraw Street. The Final RIR identified elevated levels of BTEX and semi-volatile organic compounds (SVOCs) in soil and groundwater at the Site. NYSDEC is requiring further investigation and remediation of this property, which historically operated a Major Oil Storage Facility (MOSF). However, the large storage vessels associated with this former operation were actually located at a property farther to the south of the Site (but the contamination referred to in the Final RIR is identified at property located directly south of the Site). ART’s review of groundwater quality data included in the Final RIR indicates that there is a low risk of adverse impact to the environmental integrity of the Site by conditions at this property, primarily due to its hydraulic crossgradient position relative to the Site.

State-Registered USTs

Two adjoining properties are identified in the State-Registered UST database: Bayside Fuel Oil Corp. (south of the Site across Degraw Street), and the NYCDEP sewage pumping station (north of the Site across Douglass Street). This database indicates that 17 diesel fuel and kerosene USTs were removed from the Bayside Fuel Oil Corp. property in 1998 (the MOSF database further indicates that total aboveground storage tank capacity at this facility was historically 1,500,000 gallons). The database also indicates that two 1,500-gallon diesel fuel USTs and one 550-gallon gasoline UST were removed from the NYCDEP sewage pumping station 2011. Petroleum contamination from petroleum storage and distribution operations at the Bayside Fuel Oil Corp. property is currently being addressed as required by NYSDEC. No spills or leaks associated with USTs are reported in the databases in connection with historical USTs at the NYCDEP sewage pumping station.

New York State Brownfields Program

Three Brownfields Program properties are listed within a one-half mile radius of the Site. All of these properties are located at least 1,400 feet from the Site to the south and southwest. Based on distance of these properties relative to the Site, ART concludes it is highly unlikely that any condition at these properties have adversely impacted the environmental integrity of the Site and no further investigation is recommended.

Additional Comments:

ART has submitted a Freedom of information Act request to NYSDEC for any records that they maintain for the Site. A response from this agency is pending.

5.2 Additional Environmental Records (Local Regulatory Agencies)

A review of local records for the Site was accomplished by contacting various regulatory agencies. The results of ART's regulatory agency review are presented below.

5.2.1 New York City Department of Buildings

NYCDOB records reviewed by ART show that the Site has not been assigned an "e-designation" by the City of New York. Such a designation would subject the Site to certain environmental investigation requirements before redevelopment is to occur.

Two certificates of occupancy exist in the NYCDOB Property Profile for the Site. The earliest of these documents is dated 1970 and indicates that the Site contained a "manufacturing establishment – paper products including boxes, shipping containers, etc., also printing with no limitation on floor area. The second certificate of occupancy is dated 1993 and indicates that the Site contained "Manufacture of Electrical Supplies; Accessory Offices; Lavatories; and 12'x50'x14' height interior loading berth."

5.2.2 New York City Fire Department

ART has requested information pertaining to USTs at the Site from the New York City Fire Department. No response has been received from this agency.

5.2.3 New York City Department of Planning and New York City Department of Finance

ART reviewed tax roll and payment information maintained by the Department of Finance pertaining to the various Site parcels. None of this information indicates that any liens have been initiated against the Site. ART reviewed Department of Planning data to verify Site ownership information and to verify the various addresses and Tax Block/Tax Lot numbers for the Site.

5.3 Physical Setting

5.3.1 Geological and Physical Characteristics

Before the Gowanus Canal was constructed, the Site area contained a tidal marsh and creek (as indicated by the Final RIR). Tidal marsh deposits ("meadow mat") were encountered at certain soil borings installed by the Final RIR but none of this sediment was reported to be present beneath the Site, although only a limited number of data points in the form of soil borings were installed. Information included in the Final RIR shows that varying thicknesses of fill material exist beneath the Site followed by native sand deposits. Bedrock is estimated to be approximately 130 feet bgs beneath the Site.

5.3.2 Topography

According to the United States Geological Survey (USGS) *Brooklyn, NY* Topographic Quadrangle Map, dated 1995, the elevation of the Site is less than 20 feet above mean sea level. Based on Site observations and the review of the topographic map, surface topography at the Site and nearby areas slopes down slightly east towards the Gowanus Canal.

5.3.3 Hydrology

Surface Hydrology

Slope and surface drainage at properties immediately surrounding the Site is to the east towards the Gowanus Canal. No on-site surface water bodies were depicted on the topographic map or observed at the Site on the date of ART's reconnaissance. A copy of the USGS topographic map is included as the Site location map in Section 1.0 of this report.

Groundwater (Hydrogeology)

Depth to the water table at the Site (as reported by the Final RIR) is approximately nine feet bgs. Water table elevation isopleth maps included in the Final RIR indicate that groundwater flow direction in the Upper Glacial Aquifer at the Site is to the east to southeast.

Wetlands

According to National Wetlands Inventory information provided by Environmental Data Resources, Inc. (EDR), no wetlands are present on-Site. ART observed no evidence of potential wetland areas (vegetation indicative of wetlands, standing water) at the Site during the reconnaissance.

Floodplains and Coastal Zone

ART reviewed Federal Emergency Management Act (FEMA) flood zone information provided by EDR. According to information provided by EDR, the Site is located in a 100-year floodplain. The Site does not appear to be located in an area suspected to be a coastal zone.

Sole Source Aquifer/ Aquifer Recharge Area

The Site is not located above a sole source aquifer. The Site does not appear to be located in an aquifer recharge area.

5.4 Past Uses of the Site

The primary source of determining historical uses of the Site was a review of fire insurance maps provided by EDR. The reviewed maps are dated 1886, 1904, 1915, 1928, 1938, 1950, 1969, 1979, 1982, 1987, 1988, 1995, 2002 and 2007.

Based on review of these historical fire insurance maps, the Site contained a coal yard (location of current Site building) and part of a "lime, brick & lath yard" (Site parking lot) in 1886. The 1904 and 1915 maps again show the coal yard but the Site parking lot was labeled as part of "Castle Bros. Clementine Sidewalks, gravel & crushed stone storage." The 1928 map again shows the coal yard, but the Site parking lot appears to be labeled as being a part of "Knickerbocker Ice Co." The 1938 and 1950 maps show that the coal yard remained and that the Site parking lot contained coal silos associated with the coal yard (labeling on the 1950 map indicates that the coal yard was "not operating"). The 1969 through 1987 maps identify the current Site improvements and label the Site building as containing "plastic products mfg." Labeling on these maps indicate that the current Site improvements were constructed in 1954. All post-1987 maps label the Site building simply as containing "manufacturing." The Site parking lot is labeled "parking" in all maps dated from 1969 to 2005.

ART' also acquired historical city directories from EDR for the Site and adjoining properties. City directories ranged in dates from 1928 to 2012. The earliest available city directory entries for the Site are dated 1934 and 1949. The 1934 entry identifies a coal yard at the Site. The 1949 entry identifies "John E. Larney Inc. Fuel" at the Site. "National Printing & Folding Carton Corp." is identified at the Site in the 1973 and 1976 entries and "Chuck Gurdin Inc." is listed at the Site in the 1985 entry. Other city directory listings for the Site include "Amtronics Inc." in 1997 and 2000, and Eastern Effects Inc. (current occupant) in 2007 and 2012. The 2007 entry also indicates that "Sheldon Electric Inc." also occupied the Site.

The information disclosed by the city directories and historical fire insurance maps indicate that the Site was formerly used for industrial purposes.

5.5 Past Uses of Adjoining Properties

North

Currently the NYCDEP sewage and water pumping station is located directly north of the Site across Douglass Street. In addition, a single-story warehouse/industrial building currently containing a plumbing contractor is located across Douglass Street adjacent to the NYCDEP pumping station. The 1886 fire insurance maps show that this area contained lumber and coal yards. All maps dated 1904 and later show that the sewage pumping station is present. The current location of the plumbing contractor building is shown to be occupied variously by a wagons shed, a paper box factory, a ladder factory, wood box storage, and as general manufacturing in the fire insurance maps.

South

The property to the south across Degraw Street currently contains a large open storage yard for fuel delivery trucks, with a cluster of buildings at its north side that reportedly contained vehicle repair and possibly fuel delivery filling stations (as indicated in the Final RIR). Regulatory

agency databases also identify this property as formerly being registered as an MOSF (no large fuel storage vessels were observed at this property during ART's reconnaissance). The 1886 through 1938 maps label this property as containing a coal yard. The 1950 map indicates that the property contained a lumber yard and wood box manufacturer. Later maps show that the property contained a parking, vehicle repair operations and a Ryder Truck Rental facility. Bayside Fuel Oil Co, Inc. is not identified as an occupant of this property in any of the fire insurance maps or in city directories; nor are any large petroleum storage vessels depicted. All of these storage vessels are depicted farther to the south of the Site beyond the south-adjointing property (no large aboveground storage vessels currently exist at this more southerly property as confirmed by ART's observations during the reconnaissance).

Properties south of the Site are considered by ART to be located at hydraulic crossgradient positions relative to the Site.

East

The Gowanus Canal is denoted in all historical fire insurance maps adjacent to the east side of the Site.

West

These properties currently contain a cluster of industrial buildings and a parking lot all formerly occupied by O.Z. Gedney Co. an electrical products manufacturer (including 198 Douglass Street, which is reported in regulatory agency databases as having elevated levels of PCE in groundwater). This entity has been identified by USEPA as a PRP. Historical fire insurance maps show that this operation occupied the westerly buildings from at least 1969 to at least 2007. The 1928 to 1950 maps indicate that these buildings were occupied by "Knickerbocker Ice Co." Maps dated prior to 1928 identify the operations that included the Site parking lot and are described previously in this section (see Past Uses of the Site). In addition, these early maps show that a portion of these structures contained an ice production company.

ART also reviewed city directories for a limited number of adjoining and surrounding properties. This information confirms past industrial uses at properties in the vicinity of the Site.

6.0 SITE RECONNAISSANCE

6.1 Methodology and Limiting Conditions

ART accessed all areas of the Site and conducted a walking survey of adjoining properties. No weather-related factors or other limiting conditions were encountered during the reconnaissance.

6.2 General Site Setting

The general Site setting is discussed in other sections of this report.

6.3 Hazardous Substances in Connection with Identified Uses

No hazardous substances in connection with identified uses were observed. The Site is used as a television show production studio and contains a large stage area along with a carpentry section. Painting takes place at the Site but these materials are all latex-based.

6.4 Hazardous Substance Containers and Unidentified Substance Containers

ART did not observe evidence of any hazardous substance storage or unidentified substance containers at the Site.

6.5 Storage Tanks

Underground Storage Tanks (USTs)

ART observed no physical evidence of USTs at the Site or at adjoining properties.

Aboveground Storage Tanks (ASTs)

ART observed no ASTs at the Site.

6.6 Indications of Polychlorinated Biphenyls (PCBs)

The 1976 Toxic Substances Control Act ("TSCA") banned production of PCBs and established regulations for storage, handling, transportation, disposal, spill cleanup, and inspections of electrical equipment. Equipment manufactured prior to 1976 may contain PCBs.

No evidence of electrical equipment or other devices that may contain PCBs was observed at the Site.

6.7 Indication of Solid Waste Disposal

Process Materials and Wastes

No process materials or wastes are generated at the Site.

Site Waste Containment or Deposits

No solid waste containments or deposits were observed at the Site.

6.8 Other Environmental Issues

Floor Drains

ART observed no floor drains within the Site building. No stormwater drywells exist at the Site.

Evidence of Cesspools

No cesspools were observed at the Site. It appears that the Site was always connected to the municipal sewer system.

Stressed Vegetation and Stained Soils

No stressed vegetation or stained soil was observed at the Site. However ART did observe a petroleum sheen with possible tar balls on the surface of the Gowanus Canal adjacent to the Site, although this condition appears to be a common occurrence as evidenced by State Spills incident reports discussed in Section 5.1.

Wells

ART observed no drinking water or other supply wells at the Site. ART observed several groundwater monitoring wells at on the sidewalks along Douglass Street and Degraw Street adjacent to and near the Site. These wells were installed as part of the Final RIR and other environmental investigations of the nature and extent of the contamination at the Gowanus Canal NPL.

6.9 Radon

Published radon data from the New York State Department of Health (NYSDOH) indicates that the Site is located in an area of low propensity with regard to the potential for elevated levels of radon gas. According to information provided by the NYSDOH, less than two percent of the residences in Brooklyn are likely to have an average radon level above the USEPA action level of 4.0 pCi/L. Based on this published data, radon is unlikely to represent an environmental concern for the Site.

7.0 INTERVIEWS

ART interviewed Mr. Chris Hayes, who said that he has occupied the Site since 2005. Mr. Hayes identified himself as a tenant of the building and as a representative of Eastern Effects, Inc. (current occupant). Mr. Hayes said that the Site contained a small apartment building in the past. Mr. Hayes confirmed that Eastern Effects, Inc. operates a television studio at the Site. He also said that he was unaware of any USTs at the Site. Mr. Hayes indicated that prior environmental investigations of the Site were conducted by consultants retained by National Grid. When questioned about any unusual conditions encountered during installation of a soil boring into the Site parking lot, Mr. Hayes indicated that he recalled a distinct hydrocarbon odor in the area. Mr. Hayes was aware of the NPL designation for the Gowanus Canal and he did mention that petroleum sheens and tar balls periodically arise on the surface water in the canal. Aside from the Gowanus Canal, he had no knowledge of any hazardous material/petroleum spill incidents at the Site or at adjoining properties. Mr. Hayes indicated that no hazardous materials are used as part of the television production operation inclusive of solvents and gasoline. He did say that painting of television production set pieces is conducted but only latex paint is applied.

8.0 FINDINGS

ART performed a Phase I ESA in general conformance with the scope and limitations of ASTM Practice E 1527-05 of the property located at 210 Douglass Street, Brooklyn, New York.

This ESA has identified past manufacturing use of the Site inclusive of a coal yard, paper and cardboard box and pulp-based shipping container production with printing, and some form of plastic products manufacturing. The Gowanus Canal NPL is located directly adjacent to the east side of the Site and prior investigations have confirmed that deep sediment (below approximately 20- 25 feet bgs) have been adversely impacted by coal tar released either into or in proximity of the Gowanus Canal by a nearby historical MGP.

In addition, a State Spills incident at 198 Douglass Street is reported in state regulatory agency databases reviewed by ART. This property is located directly adjacent to the west side of the Site parking lot and is attached to the north side of the Site building. The State Spills incident reportedly included discovery of elevated levels of PCE and benzene in groundwater at 198 Douglass Street. This property contains a single-story former industrial building currently used to store fine art.

Bayside Fuel Company operated an MOSF and fuel delivery vehicles from parcels located south of the Site across Degraw Street. The large aboveground storage tanks used as part of this operation were once located at a parcel not directly adjacent to the Site but farther to the south (these aboveground storage tanks are no longer present). The Final RIR did identify petroleum-related contamination in soil and groundwater at the parcel located immediately south of the Site. Groundwater quality data contained within the Final RIR does not appear to show migration of VOCs or other petroleum-related substances from this parcel to the Site, which is located at a hydraulic crossgradient position relative to the Bayside Fuel Company parcels.

ART has found no information suggesting that current or former Site owners and/or occupants have been identified as PRPs for the Gowanus Canal NPL. However this ESA did not obtain a full listing of former Site owners and occupants, which prevents ART from presenting a conclusive statement in connection with possible Site-related PRPs.

9.0 OPINIONS AND CONCLUSIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS

ART has identified Recognized Environmental Conditions at the Site. Documented contamination by petroleum and coal tar exists in deeper soil at the east section of the Site near the Gowanus Canal bulkhead. This contamination appears to be related to releases of these substances into the Gowanus Canal by a nearby historical MGP. In addition, it appears likely that PCE and benzene may be present at elevated concentrations in groundwater beneath at least a portion of the Site. ART believes it is likely these VOCs were discharged by industrial operations that took place north and west of the Site. ART cannot entirely exclude the Site as a possible source of contamination due to its long history of industrial use. The potential presence of benzene and PCE in groundwater at the Site also raises a potential vapor intrusion condition at the Site.

ART cannot entirely exclude the possibility that current or former Site owners/operators at the Site may have been contacted by the USEPA as PRPs for the Gowanus Canal NPL. Further, if such contact has not been made, ART cannot entirely exclude the possibility of USEPA contact for this purpose in the future.

10.0 DEVIATIONS

No significant data gaps were encountered during the course of this study.

11.0 ADDITIONAL SERVICES

ART was retained by the Client to observe one soil boring installed at the Site parking lot for geotechnical investigation purposes. This task was conducted on September 25, 2013. A mud rotary drill rig operated and directed by others installed a soil boring to 47 feet bgs. Due to the drilling method, ART was unable to specifically determine depth to the water table but it is assumed to be with ten feet bgs. Field evidence of soil and groundwater contamination was identified in the form of measurable volatile organic vapors by a photoionization detector. Two-foot split-spoon soil samples were collected every five feet by the drilling contractor and ART noted increasing physical evidence of contamination with depth beginning at roughly 20-25 feet bgs. The 40 to 42-foot soil sample exhibited evidence of what appeared to be free-phase heavy grade petroleum contamination and PID readings were recorded at 500 ppm, which is considered by ART to be a high instrument response. Little or no apparent evidence of coal tar was observed in the soil boring (coal tar is the byproduct of MGP operations). However, the method drilling used for the geotechnical investigation was not conducive to a thorough evaluation of soil conditions. Historical fire insurance maps and regulatory agency databases reviewed by ART identified no MGPs at the Site or at adjoining properties. The nearest former MGP facility was located east an east-southeast of the Site across the Gowanus Canal. The soil boring was discontinued at 47 feet bgs when a silty clay layer was encountered. This layer was determined to be a possible confining unit and was not penetrated.

12.0 REFERENCES

Documents:

ASTM (ASTM) 2005, *Standard Practice for Environmental Site Assessments: Phase I Environmental Site Assessment Process*, ASTM Designation E 1527-05.

Environmental Data Resources, Inc. (EDR), City Directory Abstract

EDR State and Federal Regulatory Agency Database Report

Final Remedial Investigation Report, Fulton Municipal Works Manufactured Gas Plant (MGP) Site, Brooklyn, New York, dated July 2012 by GEI Consultants

Maps:

Historical Fire Insurance Maps dated 1886, 1904, 1915, 1928, 1938, 1950, 1969, 1979, 1982, 1987, 1988, 1995, 2002 and 2007.

United States Geological Survey, 7.5-Minute Series Quadrangle Topographic Map, *Brooklyn, NY*, dated 1995

Water-Table Altitude Map, Kings and Queens Counties, New York, in March 1997 by USGS

Personal Communications/Correspondence/Research:

New York City Department of Buildings PPO

New York City Fire Department

New York City Department of Planning

New York City Department of Finance

NYSDEC (via FOIL Request)

13.0 SIGNATURES OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROFESSIONALS

I declare that, to the best of my professional knowledge and belief, I meet the definition of Environmental Professional as defined in section 312.10 of 40 CFR 312."

I have the specific qualifications based on education, training, and experience to assess a property of the nature, history, and setting of the subject property. I have developed and performed the all appropriate inquires in conformance with the standards and practices set forth in 40 CFR Part 312."

ASSESSMENT RESOURCES & TECHNOLOGIES, INC.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Frank Galdun". The signature is stylized with a large initial "F" and a long horizontal stroke at the end.

Frank Galdun
Project Manager

14.0 QUALIFICATIONS OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROFESSIONALS

The following information in this section provides the qualifications of Mr. Frank Galdun, the environmental professional that prepared this ESA.

EDUCATION

1987, MS, Environmental Science, Adelphi University
1985, BS, Geology, SUNY, Buffalo

PROFESSIONAL SUMMARY

Mr. Galdun has worked in the environmental consulting industry since 1987. Project Manager on various soil and ground water quality investigations for clients such as Toys 'R' Us, TCW Realty Advisers, Metropolitan Life Insurance Co., RREEF, and LaSalle Partners, Prudential Real Estate Investors. These investigations included evaluation of soil and ground water quality relating to potential impact on property acquisitions and development. In addition, several studies were performed within known contaminated areas in order to meet regulatory agency requirements. Projects of this type included negotiations with local and state agencies on the necessity or required extent of any clean-up tasks. The subsurface investigations were performed in a variety of geologic conditions with several types of drilling methods (Hollow Stem Auger, Mud Rotary, Air Rotary, Geoprobe).

National client program manager providing direction to local offices, conducted quality control/quality assurance tasks on all reports issued to the client, and advised the client on potential financial impact associated with properties that were found to contain contamination prior to acquisition. Mr. Galdun also has served as a client coordinator for property developers on a national basis, and has assisted clients during numerous contaminated property redevelopment projects across the country.

Directly conducted annual environmental audits for a national client on all of their properties located on the East Coast. These audits serve to assess tenant activities in order to determine if they are in compliance with OSHA, EPA, state, and local regulations pertaining to the storage, use and disposal of hazardous materials. The types of tenant operations included in the audit process are printers, metal platers, weapons systems manufacturers and other military contractors, electronic printed circuit board fabricators, biomedical production laboratories, dry cleaners and various other commercial and industrial activities. The audits included evaluating the various process waste streams at a facility, determining appropriate disposal requirements, determining compliance with hazardous waste and treated effluent discharge regulations, and assessing the potential of hazardous material/petroleum product releases at the audited facilities.

Directly supervised numerous underground storage tank removals in New York, New Jersey, Pennsylvania, Virginia and Maryland. Assisted clients in developing regional underground storage tank management programs. Mr. Galdun has also acted as project manager and technical director on numerous additional underground storage tank removal projects. Project management services include regulatory agency negotiations, supervision of employees, development of specifications, soil/groundwater sampling, remedial activities and report preparation.

Evaluation of properties for asbestos content; this includes written reports and specifications for numerous projects involving the assessment and removal of asbestos-containing building materials.

Working knowledge of pertinent federal regulations and programs, in addition to experience with state and local environmental regulations several states across the country.

Directly performed in excess of 200 Phase I Environmental Site Assessments of industrial, commercial and residential properties for various clients in connection with a variety of transactions (refinancing, new financing, acquisitions, forward commitments). These studies were conducted in various states.

Conducted training and seminars on environmental due diligence for a variety of clients, including law firms, BOMA, as well as in-house employees.