NEW YORK STATE DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL CONSERVATION

In the Matter of a Remedial Program for
Silvercup West Former NYPA Site,
42-22 to 42-48 Vernon Blvd., Long Island City under
Article 27, Title 14 of the Environmental Conservation Law
by Terra Cotta, LLC

BROWNFIELD SITE CLEANUP AGREEMENT

> Index # A2-0619-0309 Site # C241109

WHEREAS, the Brownfield Cleanup Program was enacted to encourage the voluntary remediation of brownfield sites for reuse and redevelopment so as to advance the policy of the

State of New York to conserve, improve, and protect its natural resources and environment, and control water, land, and air pollution; and

WHEREAS, the Department of Environmental Conservation (the "Department") is authorized to administer the Brownfield Cleanup Program contained in Article 27, Title 14 of the Environmental Conservation Law ("ECL"); and

WHEREAS, by a certified application dated June 27, 2007, Applicant Terra Cotta, LLC, a domestic limited liability corporation with an address of 42-22 22nd Street, Long Island City, NY 11101 submitted a request to participate in the Brownfield Cleanup Program relative to property located at 42-22 to 42-48 Vernon Boulevard in Long Island City, County of Queens; the Department has accepted the application for real property described as Tax Map Number Block 477 Lot 24 (the "Site"). A map of the Site showing its general location is attached as Exhibit "A"; and

WHEREAS, the current use of the Site is industrial occupied by an electricity generating gas turbine station owned and operated New York Power Authority. The intended use of the Site is residential and commercial including two residential towers with approximately 1,000 housing units, an approximately 1,000 seat catering facility and part of a film studio and studio support space; and

WHEREAS, an opportunity for public comment on Applicant's request to participate in the Brownfield Cleanup Program was provided and the Department duly considered all comments received; and

WHEREAS, upon consideration of the factors enumerated in ECL 27-1407(8) and (9), the Department made a determination, based upon the information contained in the application

and the certifications made by the Applicant, as well as any public comment received, that Applicant is eligible to participate in the Brownfield Cleanup Program as a Volunteer as defined in ECL 27-1405(1)(b).

NOW, THEREFORE, IN CONSIDERATION OF AND IN EXCHANGE FOR THE MUTUAL COVENANTS AND PROMISES, THE PARTIES AGREE TO THE FOLLOWING:

I. Citizen Participation Plan

Within twenty (20) Days after the effective date of this Agreement, Applicant shall submit for review and approval a written citizen participation plan prepared in accordance with the requirements of ECL 27-1417 and 6 NYCRR 375-1.10 and 375-3.10. Upon approval, the Citizen Participation Plan shall be deemed to be incorporated into and made a part of this Agreement.

II. Development, Performance, and Reporting of Work Plans

A. Work Plan Requirements

The work plans ("Work Plan" or "Work Plans") under this Agreement shall be prepared and implemented in accordance with the requirements of ECL Article 27, Title 14, 6 NYCRR 375-1.6(a), 375-3.6, and 375-6, and all applicable laws, rules, regulations, and guidance documents. The Work Plans shall be captioned as follows:

- "Remedial Investigation Work Plan" if the Work Plan provides for the investigation of the nature and extent of contamination within the boundaries of the Site and emanating from such Site;
- "Remedial Work Plan" if the Work Plan provides for the development and implementation of a Remedial Program for contamination within the boundaries of the Site and contamination that has emanated from such Site;
- "IRM Work Plan" if the Work Plan provides for an interim remedial measure; or
- 4. "Site Management Plan" if the Work Plan provides for the identification and implementation of institutional and/or engineering controls as well as any necessary monitoring and/or operation and maintenance of the remedy.

B. Submission/Implementation of Work Plans

1. The first proposed Work Plan to be submitted under this Agreement shall be submitted no later than thirty (30) Days after the effective date of this Agreement. Thereafter, the Applicant can submit such other and additional work plans as it deems appropriate.

- 2. Any proposed Work Plan shall be submitted for the Department's review and approval and shall include, at a minimum, a chronological description of the anticipated activities, a schedule for performance of those activities, and sufficient detail to allow the Department to evaluate that Work Plan. The Department shall use best efforts in accordance with 6 NYCRR 375-3.6(b) to approve, modify, or reject a proposed Work Plan within forty-five (45) Days from its receipt or within fifteen (15) Days from the close of the comment period, if applicable, whichever is later.
- i) Upon the Department's written approval of a Work Plan, such Department-approved Work Plan shall be deemed to be incorporated into and made a part of this Agreement and shall be implemented in accordance with the schedule contained therein.
- ii) If the Department requires modification of a Work Plan, the reason for such modification shall be provided in writing and the provisions of 6 NYCRR 375-1.6(d)(3) shall apply.
- iii) If the Department disapproves a Work Plan, the reason for such disapproval shall be provided in writing and the provisions of 6 NYCRR 375-1.6(d)(4) shall apply.
- A Site Management Plan, if necessary, shall be submitted in accordance with the schedule set forth in the IRM Work Plan or Remedial Work Plan.
- 4. During all field activities conducted under a Department-approved Work Plan, Applicant shall have on-Site a representative who is qualified to supervise the activities undertaken in accordance with the provisions of 6 NYCRR 375-1.6(a)(3).

C. Submission of Final Reports

- In accordance with the schedule contained in an approved Work Plan, Applicant shall submit a Final Report for an Investigation Work Plan prepared in accordance with ECL 27-1411(1) and 6 NYCRR 375-1.6. If such Final Report concludes that no remediation is necessary, and the Site does not meet the requirements for Track 1, Applicant shall submit an Alternatives Analysis prepared in accordance with ECL 27-1413 and 6 NYCRR 375-3.8(f) that supports such determination.
- 2. In accordance with the schedule contained in an approved Work Plan, Applicant shall submit a Final Engineering Report certifying that remediation of the Site has been performed in accordance with the requirements of ECL 27-1419(1) and (2) and 6 NYCRR 375-1.6(c). The Department shall review such Report, the submittals made pursuant to this Agreement, and any other relevant information regarding the Site and make a determination as to whether the goals of the remedial program have been or will be achieved in accordance with established timeframes; if so, a written Certificate of Completion will be issued in accordance with ECL 27-1419, 6 NYCRR 375-1.9 and 6 NYCRR 375-3.9.

3. Within sixty (60) Days of the Department's approval of a Final Report, Applicant shall submit such additional Work Plans as it proposes to implement. Failure to submit any additional Work Plans within such period shall, unless other Work Plans are under review by the Department or being implemented by Applicant, result in the termination of this Agreement pursuant to Paragraph XIII.

D. Review of Submittals other than Work Plans

- The Department shall timely notify Applicant in writing of its approval or disapproval of each submittal other than a Work Plan. All Department-approved submittals shall be incorporated into and become an enforceable part of this Agreement.
- 2. If the Department disapproves a submittal covered by this Subparagraph, it shall specify the reason for its disapproval and may request Applicant to modify or expand the submittal. Within fifteen (15) Days after receiving written notice that Applicant's submittal has been disapproved, Applicant shall elect in writing to either (i) modify or expand it within thirty (30) Days of receipt of the written notice of disapproval; (ii) complete any other Department-approved Work Plan(s); (iii) invoke dispute resolution pursuant to Paragraph XIV; or (iv) terminate this Agreement pursuant to Paragraph XIII. If Applicant submits a revised submittal and it is disapproved, the Department and Applicant may pursue whatever remedies may be available under this Agreement or under law.

E. Department's Determination of Need for Remediation

The Department shall determine upon its approval of each Final Report dealing with the investigation of the Site whether remediation, or additional remediation as the case may be, is needed for protection of public health and the environment.

- If the Department makes a preliminary determination that remediation, or additional remediation, is not needed for protection of public health and the environment, the Department shall notify the public of such determination and seek public comment in accordance with ECL 27-1417(3)(f). The Department shall provide timely notification to the Applicant of its final determination following the close of the public comment period.
- 2. If the Department determines that additional remediation is not needed and such determination is based upon use restrictions, Applicant shall cause to be recorded an Environmental Easement in accordance with 6 NYCRR 375-1.8(h).
- 3. If the Department determines that remediation, or additional remediation, is needed, Applicant may elect to submit for review and approval a proposed Remedial Work Plan (or modify an existing Work Plan for the Site) for a remedy selected upon due consideration of the factors set forth in ECL 27-1415(3) and 6 NYCRR 375-1.8(f). A proposed Remedial Work Plan addressing the Site's remediation will be noticed for public comment in accordance

with ECL 27-1417(3)(f) and the Citizen Participation Plan developed pursuant to this Agreement. If the Department determines following the close of the public comment period that modifications to the proposed Remedial Work Plan are needed, Applicant agrees to negotiate appropriate modifications to. If Applicant elects not to develop a Work Plan under this Subparagraph or if either party concludes that a mutually acceptable Work Plan under this Subparagraph cannot be negotiated, then this Agreement shall terminate in accordance with Subparagraph XIII.

F. Institutional/Engineering Control Certification

In the event that the remedy for the Site, if any, or any Work Plan for the Site, requires institutional or engineering controls, Applicant shall submit a written certification in accordance with 6 NYCRR 375-1.8(h)(3) and 375-3.8(h)(2).

III. Enforcement

This Agreement shall be enforceable as a contractual agreement under the laws of the State of New York. Applicant shall not suffer any penalty or be subject to any proceeding or action if it cannot comply with any requirement of this Agreement as a result of a Force Majeure Event as described at 6 NYCRR 375-1.5(b)(4) provided Applicant complies with the requirements set forth therein.

IV. Entry upon Site

- A. Applicant hereby agrees to provide access to the Site and to all relevant information regarding activities at the Site in accordance with the provisions of ECL 27-1431.
- B. The Department shall have the right to periodically inspect the Site to ensure that the use of the property complies with the terms and conditions of this Agreement.

V. Payment of State Costs

- A. Within forty-five (45) Days after receipt of an itemized invoice from the Department, Applicant shall pay to the Department a sum of money which shall represent reimbursement for State Costs as provided by 6 NYCRR 375-1.5 (b)(3)(i).
- B. Personal service costs shall be documented as provided by 6 NYCRR 375-1.5(b)(3)(ii). The Department shall not be required to provide any other documentation of costs, provided however, that the Department's records shall be available consistent with, and in accordance with, Article 6 of the Public Officers Law

C. Invoices shall be sent to Applicant at the following address:

Stuart Match Suna
Terra Cotta, LLC
42-22 22nd Street
Long Island City, New York 11101

D. Each such payment shall be made payable to the Department of Environmental Conservation and shall be sent to:

Bureau of Program Management Division of Environmental Remediation New York State Department of Environmental Conservation 625 Broadway Albany, New York 12233-7012

- E. Each party shall provide written notification to the other within ninety (90) Days of any change in the foregoing addresses.
- F. If Applicant objects to any invoiced costs under this Agreement, the provisions of 6 NYCRR 375-1.5 (b)(3)(v) and (vi) shall apply.

VI. <u>Liability Limitation</u>

Subsequent to the issuance of a Certificate of Completion pursuant to this Agreement, Applicant shall be entitled to the Liability Limitation set forth at ECL 27-1421, subject to the terms and conditions stated therein and to the provisions of 6 NYCRR 375-1.9 and 375-3.9.

VII. Reservation of Rights

- A. Except as provided in Subparagraph VII.B, Applicant reserves all rights and defenses under applicable law to contest, defend against, dispute, or disprove any action, proceeding, allegation, assertion, determination, or order of the Department, including any assertion of remedial liability by the Department against Applicant, and further reserves all rights including the rights to notice, to be heard, to appeal, and to any other due process respecting any action or proceeding by the Department, including the enforcement of this Agreement. The existence of this Agreement or Applicant's compliance with it shall not be construed as an admission of any liability, fault, wrongdoing, or violation of law by Applicant, and shall not give rise to any presumption of law or finding of fact which shall inure to the benefit of any third party.
- B. Notwithstanding the foregoing, Applicant hereby waives any right it may have to make a claim pursuant to Article 12 of the Navigation Law with respect to the Site and releases the State and the New York Environmental Protection and Spill Compensation Fund from any

and all legal or equitable claims, suits, causes of action, or demands whatsoever with respect to the Site that Applicant may have as a result of Applicant's entering into or fulfilling the terms of this Agreement.

VIII. Indemnification

Applicant shall indemnify and hold the Department, the State of New York, and their representatives and employees harmless from any claim, suit, action, and cost of every name and description arising out of or resulting from the fulfillment or attempted fulfillment of this Agreement by Applicant prior to the Termination Date except for those claims, suits, actions, and costs arising from the State's gross negligence or willful or intentional misconduct by the Department, the State of New York, and/or their representatives and employees during the course of any activities conducted pursuant to this Agreement. The Department shall provide Applicant with written notice no less than thirty (30) Days prior to commencing a lawsuit seeking indemnification pursuant to this Paragraph.

IX. Change of Use

Applicant shall notify the Department at least sixty (60) Days in advance of any change of use, as defined in ECL 27-1425, which is proposed for the Site, in accordance with the provisions of 6 NYCRR 375-1.11(d). In the event the Department determines that the proposed change of use is prohibited, the Department shall notify Applicant of such determination within forty-five (45) Days of receipt of such notice.

X. Environmental Easement

- A. Within thirty (30) Days after the Department's approval of a Remedial Work Plan which relies upon one or more institutional and/or engineering controls, or within thirty (30) Days after the Department's determination pursuant to Subparagraph II.E.2 that additional remediation is not needed based upon use restrictions, Applicant shall submit to the Department for approval an Environmental Easement to run with the land in favor of the State which complies with the requirements of ECL Article 71, Title 36 and 6 NYCRR 375-1.8(h)(2). Applicant shall cause such instrument to be recorded with the recording officer for the county in which the Site is located within thirty (30) Days after the Department's approval of such instrument. Applicant shall provide the Department with a copy of such instrument certified by the recording officer to be a true and faithful copy within thirty (30) Days of such recording (or such longer period of time as may be required to obtain a certified copy provided Applicant advises the Department of the status of its efforts to obtain same within such thirty (30) Day period), which shall be deemed to be incorporated into this Agreement.
- B. Applicant or the owner of the Site may petition the Department to modify or extinguish the Environmental Easement filed pursuant to this Agreement at such time as it can certify that the Site is protective of human health and the environment without reliance upon the

restrictions set forth in such instrument. Such certification shall be made by a Professional Engineer or other expert approved by the Department. The Department will not unreasonably withhold its consent.

XI. Progress Reports

Applicant shall submit a written progress report of its actions under this Agreement to the parties identified in Subparagraph XII.A.1 by the 10th day of each month commencing with the month subsequent to the approval of the first Work Plan and ending with the Termination Date, unless a different frequency is set forth in a Work Plan. Such reports shall, at a minimum, include: all actions relative to the Site during the previous reporting period and those anticipated for the next reporting period; all approved activity modifications (changes of work scope and/or schedule); all results of sampling and tests and all other data received or generated by or on behalf of Applicant in connection with this Site, whether under this Agreement or otherwise, in the previous reporting period, including quality assurance/quality control information; information regarding percentage of completion; unresolved delays encountered or anticipated that may affect the future schedule and efforts made to mitigate such delays; and information regarding activities undertaken in support of the Citizen Participation Plan during the previous reporting period and those anticipated for the next reporting period.

XII. Communications

- A. All written communications required by this Agreement shall be transmitted by United States Postal Service, by private courier service, by hand delivery, or by electronic mail.
 - 1. Communication from Applicant shall be sent to:

Shaun Bollers
NYS Department of Environmental Conservation, Region 2
Division of Environmental Remediation
47-40 21st Street
Long Island City, New York 11101
snboller@gw.dec.state.ny.us

Note: three hard copies (one unbound) of work plans are required, as well as one electronic copy.

Gary Litwin
Bureau of Environmental Exposure Investigation
New York State Department of Health
Flanigan Square
547 River Street
Troy, New York 12180-2216

gal09@health.state.ny.us

Note: two copies of work plans are required, and

Alan T. Michaels, Esq.

NYS Department of Environmental Conservation
Office of General Counsel
625 Broadway, 14th Floor
Albany, New York 12233-5500
atmichae@gw.dec.state.ny.us

Correspondence only

2. Communication from the Department to Applicant shall be sent to:

Joel Landes, P.E.
Langan Engineering and Environmental Services, PC
21 Penn Plaza
360 W. 31st Street, 8th Floor
New York, NY 10001
jlandes@langan.com

with a copy to:

Paul Casowitz, Esq. Sive, Paget & Riesel 460 Park Avenue New York, NY 10022 pcasowitz@sprlaw.com

Correspondence only

- B. The Department and Applicant reserve the right to designate additional or different addressees for communication on written notice to the other.
- C. Each party shall notify the other within ninety (90) Days after any change in the addresses listed in this Paragraph XII or in Paragraph V.

XIII. Termination of Agreement

Applicant or the Department may terminate this Agreement consistent with the provisions of 6 NYCRR 375-3.5(b), (c), and (d) by providing written notification to the parties listed in Subparagraph XII.A.

XIV. Dispute Resolution

In the event disputes arise under this Agreement, Applicant may, within fifteen (15) Days after Applicant knew or should have known of the facts which are the basis of the dispute, initiate dispute resolution in accordance with the provisions of 6 NYCRR 375-1.5(b)(2).

XV. Miscellaneous

- A. If the information provided and any certifications made by Applicant are not materially accurate and complete, this Agreement, except with respect to Applicant's obligations pursuant to Paragraphs V, VII.B, and VIII, shall be null and void *ab initio* fifteen (15) Days after the Department's notification of such inaccuracy or incompleteness or fifteen (15) Days after issuance of a final decision resolving a dispute pursuant to Paragraph XIV, whichever is later, unless Applicant submits information within that fifteen (15) Day time period indicating that the information provided and the certifications made were materially accurate and complete. In the event this Agreement is rendered null and void, any Certificate of Completion and/or Liability Limitation that may have been issued or may have arisen under this Agreement shall also be null and void *ab initio*, and the Department shall reserve all rights that it may have under law.
- B. By entering into this Agreement, Applicant agrees to comply with and be bound by the provisions of 6 NYCRR Subparts 375-1, 375-3 and 375-6; the provisions of such Subparts that are referenced herein are referenced for clarity and convenience only and the failure of this Agreement to specifically reference any particular regulatory provision is not intended to imply that such provision is not applicable to activities performed under this Agreement.
- C. The Department may exempt Applicant from the requirement to obtain any state or local permit or other authorization for any activity conducted pursuant to this Agreement in accordance with 6 NYCRR 375-1.12(b), (c), and (d).
- D. 1. Applicant shall use "best efforts" to obtain all Site access, permits, easements, approvals, institutional controls, and/or authorizations necessary to perform Applicant's obligations under this Agreement, including all Department-approved Work Plans and the schedules contained therein. If, despite Applicant's best efforts, any access, permits, easements, approvals, institutional controls, or authorizations cannot be obtained, Applicant shall promptly notify the Department and include a summary of the steps taken. The Department may, as it deems appropriate and within its authority, assist Applicant in obtaining same.
- If an interest in property is needed to implement an institutional control required by a Work Plan and such interest cannot be obtained, the Department may require Applicant to modify the Work Plan pursuant to 6 NYCRR 375-1.6(d)(3) to reflect changes necessitated by Applicant's inability to obtain such interest.

- E. The paragraph headings set forth in this Agreement are included for convenience of reference only and shall be disregarded in the construction and interpretation of any provisions of this Agreement.
- F. 1. The terms of this Agreement shall constitute the complete and entire agreement between the Department and Applicant concerning the implementation of the activities required by this Agreement. No term, condition, understanding, or agreement purporting to modify or vary any term of this Agreement shall be binding unless made in writing and subscribed by the party to be bound. No informal advice, guidance, suggestion, or comment by the Department shall be construed as relieving Applicant of Applicant's obligation to obtain such formal approvals as may be required by this Agreement. In the event of a conflict between the terms of this Agreement and any Work Plan submitted pursuant to this Agreement, the terms of this Agreement shall control over the terms of the Work Plan(s). Applicant consents to and agrees not to contest the authority and jurisdiction of the Department to enter into or enforce this Agreement.
- i. Except as set forth herein, if Applicant desires that any provision of this Agreement be changed, Applicant shall make timely written application to the Commissioner with copies to the parties listed in Subparagraph XII.A.1.
- If Applicant seeks to modify an approved Work Plan, a written request shall be made to the Department's project manager, with copies to the parties listed in Subparagraph XII.A.1.
- iii. Requests for a change to a time frame set forth in this Agreement shall be made in writing to the Department's project attorney and project manager; such requests shall not be unreasonably denied and a written response to such requests shall be sent to Applicant promptly.
- G. 1. If there are multiple parties signing this Agreement, the term "Applicant" shall be read in the plural, the obligations of each such party under this Agreement are joint and several, and the insolvency of or failure by any Applicant to implement any obligations under this Agreement shall not affect the obligations of the remaining Applicant(s) under this Agreement.
- 2. If Applicant is a partnership, the obligations of all general partners (including limited partners who act as general partners) under this Agreement are joint and several and the insolvency or failure of any general partner to implement any obligations under this Agreement shall not affect the obligations of the remaining partner(s) under this Agreement.
- 3. Notwithstanding the foregoing Subparagraphs XV.G.1 and 2, if multiple parties sign this Agreement as Applicants but not all of the signing parties elect to implement a Work Plan, all Applicants are jointly and severally liable for each and every obligation under this Agreement through the completion of activities in such Work Plan that all such parties consented

to; thereafter, only those Applicants electing to perform additional work shall be jointly and severally liable under this Agreement for the obligations and activities under such additional Work Plan(s). The parties electing not to implement the additional Work Plan(s) shall have no obligations under this Agreement relative to the activities set forth in such Work Plan(s). Further, only those Applicants electing to implement such additional Work Plan(s) shall be eligible to receive the Liability Limitation referenced in Paragraph VI.

- Applicant shall be entitled to receive contribution protection and/or to seek H. contribution to the extent authorized by ECL 27-1421(6) and 6 NYCRR 375-1.5(b)(5).
- Applicant shall not be considered an operator of the Site solely by virtue of having executed and/or implemented this Agreement.
- Applicant and Applicant's agents, grantees, lessees, sublessees, successors, and assigns shall be bound by this Agreement. Any change in ownership of Applicant including, but not limited to, any transfer of assets or real or personal property, shall in no way alter Applicant's responsibilities under this Agreement.
- Unless otherwise expressly provided herein, terms used in this Agreement which K are defined in ECL Article 27 or in regulations promulgated thereunder shall have the meaning assigned to them under said statute or regulations.
- Applicant's obligations under this Agreement represent payment for or reimbursement of response costs, and shall not be deemed to constitute any type of fine or penalty.
- This Agreement may be executed for the convenience of the parties hereto, individually or in combination, in one or more counterparts, each of which shall be deemed to have the status of an executed original and all of which shall together constitute one and the same.
- The effective date of this Agreement is the date it is signed by the Commissioner or the Commissioner's designee.

DATED:

ALEXANDER B. GRANNIS

COMMISSIONER

NEW YORK STATE DEPARTMENT OF

ENVIRONMENTAL CONSERVATION

By:

Dale A. Desnovers, Director

Division of Environmental Remediation

A 2009

CONSENT BY APPLICANT

Applicant hereby consents to the issuing and entering of this Agreement, waives Applicant's right to a hearing herein as provided by law, and agrees to be bound by this Agreement.

Terra (Cotta, LLC	
Ву:		
Туре:_	Stuart Match Suna	
Title:	MEMBER	
Date:	11/3/09	* 1 - March 2016 - (Long - A. 1) (Long - A. 1)

STATE OF NEW YORK) ss:
COUNTY OF PEN YORK)

On the 3/d day of Notember, in the year 2009, before me, the undersigned, personally appeared Street Moth Sept, personally known to me or proved to me on the basis of satisfactory evidence to be the individual(s) whose name is (are) subscribed to the within instrument and acknowledged to me that he/she/they executed the same in his/her/their capacity(ies), and that by his/her/their signature(s) on the instrument, the individual(s), or the person upon behalf of which the individual(s) acted, executed the instrument.

Signature and Office of individual taking acknowledgment

MARK A. CHERTOK
Notary Public, State of New York
No. 02CH5020188
Qualified in New York County
Commission Expires November 15, 2009

EXHIBIT "A"

Map