

**MODIFICATION OF THE
CATALUM SPDES PERMIT
DRAFT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT STATEMENT**



Lead Agency:

New York State Department of Environmental Conservation

Applicant:

New York City Department of Environmental Protection

December 2020

This page intentionally left blank

**Modification of the Catalum SPDES Permit
Draft Environmental Impact Statement**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACRONYMS..... AC-1

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY ES-1

ES 1. INTRODUCTION..... ES-1

ES 2. EIS PROCESS ES-5

ES 3. BACKGROUND OF MODIFICATION OF THE CATALUM SPDES PERMIT..... ES-5

ES 4. OVERVIEW OF THE PROPOSED ACTION..... ES-10

ES 5. PROPOSED ACTION IN THE LOWER ESOPUS CREEK STUDY AREA ES-13

ES 6. PROPOSED ACTION IN THE KENSICO RESERVOIR STUDY AREA ES-33

ES 7. ALTERNATIVES ANALYSIS SUMMARY ES-39

**ES 8. PROPOSED REVISED OPERATING PROTOCOL, PROPOSED REVISED MONITORING
 PLAN, AND ADDITIONAL CONSIDERATIONS ES-43**

1. INTRODUCTION.....1-1

1.1 REGULATORY DRIVERS OF THE PROPOSED ACTION.....1-4

1.2 BACKGROUND.....1-6

 1.2.1 Overview of the Water Supply System and System Operations..... 1-6

 1.2.2 Operation of the Catskill Water Supply System 1-6

 1.2.3 Emergency Authorizations for Alum Application 1-12

 1.2.4 Alum Application and Ashokan Release Channel Use..... 1-13

1.3 TURBIDITY CONTROL MEASURES.....1-19

 1.3.1 Catskill Aqueduct Stop Shutter Improvements..... 1-19

 1.3.2 Catskill and Delaware Aqueducts Interconnection at Shaft 4..... 1-20

 1.3.3 Croton Water Filtration Plant..... 1-20

 1.3.4 Operations Support Tool..... 1-20

2. PURPOSE AND NEED2-1

3. PROPOSED ACTION.....3-1

3.1 OPERATION OF ASHOKAN RESERVOIR IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE IRP3-1

3.2 DELAY OF DREDGING AT KENSICO RESERVOIR3-1

4. ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK.....4-1

5. EIS METHODOLOGY5-1

5.1 OPERATIONS SUPPORT TOOL MODELING OF ASHOKAN RESERVOIR OPERATIONS5-1

5.2 LOWER ESOPUS CREEK MODELING METHODOLOGY5-3

5.2.1 Analysis Approach.....5-3

5.2.2 Analysis Conditions for Lower Esopus Creek.....5-6

5.2.3 Total Flow Estimation5-10

5.2.4 Hydrologic Engineering Center River Analysis System.....5-10

5.3 IMPACT ASSESSMENT METHODOLOGY5-11

5.3.1 Water Resources and Water Quality.....5-11

5.3.2 Public Policy, Land Use, and Zoning5-23

5.3.3 Socioeconomic Conditions5-24

5.3.4 Open Space and Recreation5-30

5.3.5 Critical Environmental Areas5-31

5.3.6 Historic and Cultural Resources5-31

5.3.7 Aesthetic (Visual) Resources.....5-31

5.3.8 Natural Resources.....5-34

5.3.9 Hazardous Materials5-38

5.3.10 Infrastructure and Energy5-39

5.3.11 Transportation.....5-39

5.3.12 Air Quality5-39

5.3.13 Noise5-40

5.3.14 Greenhouse Gas Emissions and Climate Change5-40

5.3.15 Public Health.....5-40

6. PROPOSED ACTION IN LOWER ESOPUS CREEK STUDY AREA.....6-1

6.1 LOWER ESOPUS CREEK STUDY AREA6-1

6.1.1 Geology and Soils.....6-2

6.1.2 Surface Water Inputs to Lower Esopus Creek.....6-9

6.1.3 Groundwater Inputs to Lower Esopus Creek.....6-12

6.1.4 Summary of Valley Reach Characteristics6-12

6.2 OPERATION OF ASHOKAN RESERVOIR IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE IRP6-14

7. POTENTIAL IMPACTS AND BENEFITS OF THE PROPOSED ACTION ON LOWER ESOPUS CREEK7-1

7.1 WATER RESOURCES AND WATER QUALITY7-1

7.1.1 Flow Regime and Water Quality In Lower Esopus Creek.....7-1

7.1.2 Summary of Effects of The Proposed Action on DEP Water Supply Reliability.....7-45

7.1.3	Summary of Effects of the Proposed Action on Flow Regime and Water Quality in Lower Esopus Creek.....	7-47
7.1.4	Parameters Evaluated for the Technical Area Assessments – Flow Regime and Water Quality.....	7-49
7.2	PUBLIC POLICY, LAND USE, AND ZONING	7-80
7.3	SOCIOECONOMIC CONDITIONS	7-103
7.4	OPEN SPACE AND RECREATION	7-127
7.5	HISTORIC AND CULTURAL RESOURCES	7-140
7.6	AESTHETIC (VISUAL) RESOURCES	7-154
7.7	AQUATIC RESOURCES	7-168
7.8	WETLANDS AND FLOODPLAIN FORESTS.....	7-193
7.9	TERRESTRIAL AND WILDLIFE RESOURCES	7-211
7.10	HAZARDOUS MATERIALS	7-224
7.11	INFRASTRUCTURE AND ENERGY	7-227
8.	PROPOSED ACTION IN THE KENSICO RESERVOIR STUDY AREA	8-1
8.1	KENSICO RESERVOIR PROJECT DESCRIPTION	8-1
8.1.1	Background.....	8-1
8.1.2	Project Overview	8-2
8.2	KENSICO RESERVOIR DREDGING ANALYSIS.....	8-4
8.2.1	Delay of Dredging	8-4
8.2.2	Environmental Considerations of Dredging	8-6
8.2.3	Schedule.....	8-16
8.3	POTENTIAL IMPACTS AND BENEFITS OF THE PROPOSED ACTION ON KENSICO RESERVOIR STUDY AREA	8-17
8.3.1	Water Resources and Water Quality.....	8-17
8.3.2	Aquatic (Fish and Benthic) Resources.....	8-26
8.3.3	Wetlands	8-46
8.3.4	Terrestrial and Wildlife Resources	8-52
8.3.5	Public Policy, Land Use, and Zoning	8-59
8.3.6	Open Space and Recreation	8-65
8.3.7	Critical Environmental Areas	8-68
8.3.8	Historic and Cultural Resources	8-70
8.3.9	Aesthetic (Visual) Resources.....	8-73
8.3.10	Hazardous Materials	8-79
8.3.11	Infrastructure and Energy	8-82
8.3.12	Transportation.....	8-84

8.3.13 Air Quality8-85

8.3.14 Noise8-88

9. PROJECT-WIDE IMPACT ASSESSMENT: PUBLIC HEALTH9-1

10. CUMULATIVE IMPACTS10-1

11. MITIGATION AND UNAVOIDABLE ADVERSE IMPACTS.....11-1

12. GROWTH INDUCEMENT12-1

13. IRREVERSIBLE AND IRRETRIEVABLE COMMITMENT OF RESOURCES.....13-1

14. ALTERNATIVES ANALYSIS.....14-1

14.1 APPROACH14-3

14.2 ANALYSIS OF ALTERNATIVES.....14-4

14.2.1 Ashokan Reservoir Alternatives 14-4

14.2.2 Catskill Aqueduct Alternatives 14-11

14.2.3 Kensico Reservoir Alternatives 14-15

14.2.4 Summary Comparison of Alternatives..... 14-20

14.3 ASHOKAN RESERVOIR ALTERNATIVE 6 – REVISED OPERATING PROTOCOL.....14-23

14.3.1 Analysis Framework 14-23

14.3.2 Variations to the Interim Release Protocol 14-23

14.3.3 Effect of Ashokan Reservoir Alternative 6 on DEP Water Supply Reliability 14-30

14.3.4 Effect of Ashokan Reservoir Alternative 6 on Lower Esopus Creek 14-34

14.3.5 Proposed Revised Operating Protocol 14-36

14.4 PROPOSED REVISED MONITORING PLAN14-41

APPENDICES

Appendix A - Proposed Revised Operating Protocol and Proposed Revised Monitoring Plan.....A-1

Appendix B - Socioeconomic Survey Questionnaires.....B-1

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure ES-1.	Water Supply System Overview	ES-2
Figure ES-2.	Water in Ashokan Reservoir.....	ES-7
Figure ES-3.	Ashokan Reservoir, Ashokan Release Channel, and Spillway	ES-9
Figure ES-4.	Overview of the Interim Ashokan Release Protocol (IRP).....	ES-12
Figure ES-5.	EIS Analysis Framework: Lower Esopus Creek.....	ES-15
Figure ES-6.	Lower Esopus Creek General Study Area	ES-18
Figure ES-7.	Sub-watersheds by Valley Reach of Lower Esopus Creek.....	ES-20
Figure ES-8.	Modeled Occurrence and Average Annual Flow of Releases in the Future With the Proposed Action.....	ES-22
Figure ES-9.	Potential Difference Between the Future Without and With the Proposed Action for Lower Esopus Creek	ES-27
Figure ES-10.	Kensico Reservoir Study Area.....	ES-35
Figure ES-11.	Modeled Range of Average Settled Thickness of Alum Floc During WFF Program.....	ES-36
Figure ES-12.	Proposed Revised Operating Protocol CSSO Curve Shape.....	ES-44
Figure ES-13.	Proposed Monitoring Sites Along Lower EsopusCreek Included in the Proposed Revised Monitoring Plan	ES-47
Figure 1-1.	Water Supply System Overview	1-3
Figure 1-2.	Ashokan Reservoir, Ashokan Release Channel, and Spillway	1-8
Figure 1-3.	Schematic of the Catskill/Delaware Water Supply System	1-9
Figure 1-4.	Conceptual Alum Application and Settling Process	1-10
Figure 1-5.	Kensico Reservoir Study Area.....	1-11
Figure 1-6.	Historical Application of Alum at Kensico Reservoir	1-14
Figure 1-7.	Summary of Turbidity Control Studies.....	1-15
Figure 1-8.	Historical Use of the Ashokan Release Channel	1-17
Figure 1-9.	Stop Shutter Schematic	1-19
Figure 1-10.	Overview of DEP’s Operations Support Tool	1-21
Figure 3-1.	Overview of the Interim Ashokan Release Protocol (IRP).....	3-2
Figure 5.2-1.	Observed Streamflow at the Coldbrook Gage (USGS 013625000) Over the Period of Record, For the Last 30 Years, and for Wet, Normal, and Dry Years	5-5
Figure 5.3-1.	Lower Esopus Creek Study Area Stream Geomorphology Cross Sections.....	5-15
Figure 5.3-2.	Typical Stream Valley Slope-Break Features and Channel-forming (CF) Terraces	5-17
Figure 5.3-3.	Illustrative View of Bank Pin Configuration and Example of Bank Pins in Lower Esopus Creek.....	5-20
Figure 5.3-4.	Lower Esopus Creek Survey Photos.....	5-26

Figure 6.1-1. Lower Esopus Creek General Study Area6-3

Figure 6.1-2. Lower Esopus Creek Study Area Bedrock Formations6-5

Figure 6.1-3. Lower Esopus Creek Surficial Geology6-7

Figure 6.1-4. Sub-watersheds by Valley Reach of Lower Esopus Creek.....6-10

Figure 6.1-5. Observed Annualized Streamflow for Lower Esopus Creek at Mount Marion,
Water Year 1971–2012 (Pre-IRP)6-11

Figure 6.1-6. Observed Annualized Streamflow for Lower Esopus Creek at Mount Marion,
Water Year 2013–2018 (IRP)6-11

Figure 7.1-1. Modeled Annualized Ashokan Reservoir Spills for the Future Without the Proposed
Action and the Future With the Proposed Action7-3

Figure 7.1-2. Modeled Occurrence of Spill Turbidity Levels by Type of Year in the Future
Without the Proposed Action.....7-4

Figure 7.1-3. Modeled Occurrence of Spill Turbidity Levels by Type of Year in the Future
With the Proposed Action.....7-4

Figure 7.1-4. Modeled Annualized Releases in the Future Without and With the Proposed Action7-5

Figure 7.1-5. Modeled Occurrence and Average Annual Flow of Releases in the Future With the
Proposed Action.....7-6

Figure 7.1-6. Modeled Average Release Turbidity in the Future With the Proposed Action7-7

Figure 7.1-7. Modeled Comparison of Turbidity Levels between the Future Without and
With the Proposed Action.....7-8

Figure 7.1-8. Modeled Annualized Streamflow for the Future Without and Future
With the Proposed Action at the Spillway Confluence.....7-10

Figure 7.1-9. Modeled Annualized Streamflow for the Future Without and Future With the
Proposed Action at Mount Marion7-10

Figure 7.1-10. Modeled Streamflow for the 50th and 75th Percentile Water Year at the Spillway
Confluence7-12

Figure 7.1-11. Modeled Streamflow for the 50th and 75th Percentile Water Year at Mount Marion.....7-12

Figure 7.1-12. Modeled Streamflow Duration Curves along Lower Esopus Creek (Mount Marion
Period of Record).....7-13

Figure 7.1-13. Observed Streamflow and Turbidity Levels at Lomontville for 2018-2019.....7-14

Figure 7.1-14. Observed Streamflow and Turbidity Levels at Mount Marion for 2018-2019.....7-15

Figure 7.1-15. Box Plots of All Observed Turbidity Level Data Collected at the Release Channel
(2013-2019), Lomontville (2016-2019), and Mount Marion (2013-2019).....7-16

Figure 7.1-16. Water Quality Data Collection Sites.....7-17

Figure 7.1-17. Observed Streamflow and Turbidity Levels at Mount Marion (2016-2017).....7-19

Figure 7.1-18. Observed Streamflow and Turbidity Levels at Mount Marion (2018-2019).....7-20

Figure 7.1-19. Observed Streamflow and Turbidity Levels at Lomontville (2018-2019).....7-21

Figure 7.1-20. Observed Temperature Profile Along Lower Esopus Creek.....7-23

Figure 7.1-21.	Observed Dissolved Oxygen for Points Along Esopus Creek, 2011–2018.....	7-24
Figure 7.1-22.	Observed pH for Points Along Esopus Creek, 2011–2018.....	7-24
Figure 7.1-23.	Observed Flood Magnitudes at Mount Marion for 2-Month to 100-Year Recurrence Intervals	7-25
Figure 7.1-24.	Modeled Flood Magnitudes at Mount Marion for 2-Month to 100-Year Recurrence Intervals	7-26
Figure 7.1-25.	Modeled Flood Magnitudes at Mount Marion for 2-Month to 10-Year Recurrence Intervals	7-27
Figure 7.1-26.	Modeled Flood Magnitudes for Various Streamflow Events Along Lower Esopus Creek	7-27
Figure 7.1-27.	2016 FEMA FIS Locations along Lower Esopus Creek.....	7-29
Figure 7.1-28.	Turbidity Levels in Ashokan Reservoir	7-33
Figure 7.1-29.	Modeled Flow Rates and Turbidity Levels Along Lower Esopus Creek for the April 2005 Tubidity Level Event.....	7-39
Figure 7.1-30.	Modeled Flow Rates and Turbidity Levels of Spills and Releases for the March 2011 Turbidity Level Event.....	7-41
Figure 7.1-31.	Modeled Flow Rates and Turbidity Levels of Spills and Releases for the September 2011 Turbidity Level Event.....	7-43
Figure 7.1-32.	Flow Regime and Water Quality Parameters Evaluated for the Proposed Action in Lower Esopus Creek.....	7-50
Figure 7.1-33.	100- and 500-year FEMA Floodplains in Lower Esopus Creek Watershed.....	7-52
Figure 7.1-34.	100- and 500-year FEMA Floodplains in Lower Esopus Creek Watershed.....	7-53
Figure 7.1-35.	100- and 500-year FEMA Floodplains in Lower Esopus Creek Watershed.....	7-54
Figure 7.1-36.	100- and 500-year FEMA Floodplains in Lower Esopus Creek Watershed.....	7-55
Figure 7.1-37.	Modeled Velocity of Streamflow by Valley Reach in the Future Without and With the Proposed Action.....	7-56
Figure 7.1-38.	Modeled Depth of Sreamflow by Valley Reach in the Future Without and With the Proposed Action.....	7-56
Figure 7.1-39.	Modeled Inundation in Valley Reach 1A – Vicinity of the Ashokan Center	7-57
Figure 7.1-40.	Modeled Inundation in Valley Reach 1B – Vicinity of Hurley Mountain Road Bridge (Lomontville Gage).....	7-58
Figure 7.1-41.	Modeled Inundation in Valley Reach 2C – Vicinity of Fording Place Road.....	7-58
Figure 7.1-42.	Modeled Inundation in Valley Reach 3D – Vicinity of Leggs Mill Road (Lake Katrine).....	7-59
Figure 7.1-43.	Lower Esopus Creek Study Area Photograph Documentation of Conditions: Background Streamflow and 600 MGD Releases	7-63
Figure 7.1-44.	Observed TSS and Turbidity Levels Along Lower Esopus Creek	7-66
Figure 7.1-45.	Lower Esopus Creek Study Area Stream Geomorphology Cross Sections.....	7-70

Figure 7.1-46. Observed Total Bank Retreat by Cross-Section over Seven Years of Monitoring, 2012 to 20187-71

Figure 7.1-47. Lower Esopus Creek Study Area Local Near-bank Conditions Affecting Erosion.....7-73

Figure 7.1-48. Lower Esopus Creek Localized Factors Affecting Retreat.....7-79

Figure 7.2-1. Lower Esopus Creek FEMA Special Flood Hazard Area.....7-81

Figure 7.2-2. Lower Esopus Creek Coastal Management Zone7-83

Figure 7.2-3. Lower Esopus Creek Land Use Designation in Town of Olive.....7-87

Figure 7.2-4. Lower Esopus Creek Land Use Designations in the Town of Marbletown.....7-88

Figure 7.2-5. Lower Esopus Creek Land Use Designations in the Town of Hurley and City of Kingston7-89

Figure 7.2-6. Lower Esopus Creek Land Use Designations in Town of Ulster7-91

Figure 7.2-7. Lower Esopus Creek Land Use Designations in Town of Saugerties.....7-92

Figure 7.2-8. Lower Esopus Creek Zoning Districts in Town of Olive, Town of Marbletown, and Town of Hurley7-93

Figure 7.2-9. Lower Esopus Creek Agricultural District Overlay.....7-94

Figure 7.2-10. Lower Esopus Creek Zoning Districts in the Town of Ulster and City of Kingston.....7-96

Figure 7.2-11. Lower Esopus Creek Zoning Districts in Town of Saugerties and Village of Saugerties.....7-98

Figure 7.3-1. Lower Esopus Creek 12-Census Tracts7-105

Figure 7.3-2. Lower Esopus Creek Businesses and Farms within the Socioeconomic Study Area..7-111

Figure 7.4-1. Lower Esopus Creek Open Space and Recreational Resources.....7-130

Figure 7.5-1. Lower Esopus Creek Properties Listed on National/State Register of Historic Places7-144

Figure 7.5-2. Lower Esopus Creek Properties Listed on National/State Register of Historic Places7-145

Figure 7.5-3. Lower Esopus Creek Properties Listed on National/State Register of Historic Places7-146

Figure 7.5-4. Lower Esopus Creek Properties Listed on National/State Register of Historic Places7-147

Figure 7.5-5. Lower Esopus Creek Properties Listed on National/State Register of Historic Places7-148

Figure 7.5-6. Lower Esopus Creek Properties Listed on National/State Register of Historic Places7-149

Figure 7.5-7. Lower Esopus Creek Properties Listed in National/State Register of Historic Places7-151

Figure 7.5-8. Lower Esopus Creek The Ashokan-Turnwood Covered Bridge during Typical (Background) Streamflow and 600 MGD Release7-152

Figure 7.6-1. Lower Esopus Creek (Western Portion) Visual Resources7-157

Figure 7.6-2. Lower Esopus Creek (Eastern Portion) Visual Resources.....7-158

Figure 7.7-1. Lower Esopus Creek Study Area Fish and Macroinvertebrate Sampling Stations.....7-169

Figure 7.7-2. Lower Esopus Creek Study Area Fish and Macroinvertebrate Sampling Stations.....7-170

Figure 7.7-3. Lower Esopus Creek Study Area Observed Submerged Aquatic Vegetation Beds7-178

Figure 7.8-1. Lower Esopus Creek Wetlands and Floodplain Forests – Upstream of Spillway
Confluence.....7-195

Figure 7.8-2. Lower Esopus Creek Wetlands and Floodplain Forests – Downstream of Spillway
Confluence.....7-196

Figure 7.8-3. Lower Esopus Creek Wetlands and Floodplain Forest – Downstream of Spillway
Confluence.....7-197

Figure 7.8-4. Lower Esopus Creek Wetlands and Floodplain Forest – Downstream of Spillway
Confluence.....7-198

Figure 7.8-5. Vegetative Community Changes Documented Wetlands Upstream of the Spillway
Confluence.....7-202

Figure 7.8-6. Vegetative Community Changes Documented Wetlands Downstream of the
Spillway Confluence.....7-204

Figure 7.8-7. Emerald Ash Borer (EAB) in New York State.....7-207

Figure 7.9-1. Lower Esopus Creek National Land Cover Data for the Lower Esopus Creek
Study Area.....7-213

Figure 7.9-2. Lower Esopus Creek National Land Cover Data for the Lower Esopus Creek
Study Area.....7-214

Figure 7.9-3. Lower Esopus Creek National Land Cover Data for the Lower Esopus Creek
Study Area.....7-215

Figure 7.9-4. Lower Esopus Creek National Land Cover Data for the Lower Esopus Creek
Study Area.....7-216

Figure 7.10-1. Lower Esopus Creek Bulk Storage Tank Sites.....7-225

Figure 8.1-1. Kensico Reservoir Project Location8-3

Figure 8.2-1. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Modeled Range of Average Settled Thickness of
Alum Floc during WFF Program.....8-5

Figure 8.3-1. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Surface Water Locations and Water Quality
Sampling Stations8-18

Figure 8.3-2. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Alum Floc Deposition Area8-22

Figure 8.3-3. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Flood Zones.....8-24

Figure 8.3-4. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Benthic Locations Sampled in Both 2007 and 20148-29

Figure 8.3-5. Length Frequency Distribution and Year Class of Brown Trout Collected in Kensico
Reservoir via Boat Electrofishing Sampling Efforts in 1990, 1991, 1993, and 2001
along with Gill Net Surveys Conducted in 1991, 2001, and 2010.....8-36

Figure 8.3-6. Length Frequency Distribution of Lake Trout Collected in Kensico Reservoir via
Boat Electrofishing Sampling Efforts in 1990, 1991, 1993, and 2001 along with
Gill Net Surveys Conducted in 1991, 2001, and 2010.....8-38

Figure 8.3-7. Total Abundance of Benthic Invertebrates (Inside and Outside of CATIC Cove Alum Floc Deposition Area), 2007 and 2014 Surveys8-41

Figure 8.3-8. Taxa Richness of Benthic Invertebrates (Inside and Outside of CATIC Cove Alum Floc Deposition Area), 2007 and 2014 Surveys8-41

Figure 8.3-9. Shannon Diversity Index (Inside and Outside of CATIC Cove Alum Floc Deposition Area), 2007 and 2014 Surveys8-42

Figure 8.3-10. Percent Abundance of Chironomids (Inside and Outside of CATIC Cove Alum Floc Deposition Area), 2007 and 2014 Surveys8-42

Figure 8.3-11. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Wetlands.....8-50

Figure 8.3-12. Kensico Reservoir Study Area National Land Cover Data.....8-55

Figure 8.3-13. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Land Use Designations.....8-62

Figure 8.3-14. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Zoning Districts.....8-63

Figure 8.3-15. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Open Space and Recreational Resources8-67

Figure 8.3-16. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Critical Environmental Area8-69

Figure 8.3-17. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Historic and Cultural Resources.....8-72

Figure 8.3-18. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Visual Resources.....8-74

Figure 8.3-19. Kensico Reservoir Study Area Spill Sites8-80

Figure 8.3-20. Kensico Reservoir Noise Study Area8-90

Figure 14.2-1. Ashokan Reservoir Alternatives14-5

Figure 14.2-2. Existing East Basin Dividing Weir and Diversion Wall.....14-8

Figure 14.2-3. Catskill Aqueduct Alternatives14-13

Figure 14.2-4. Kensico Reservoir Alternatives14-16

Figure 14.3-1. Alternate CSSO Curves for Ashokan Reservoir14-25

Figure 14.3-2. Observed Storage Levels at Ashokan Reservoir (2013-2019).....14-25

Figure 14.3-3. Maximum Release Level Comparison.....14-26

Figure 14.3-4. Maximum Release Level Comparison – Flood Recurrence14-27

Figure 14.3-5. Shandaken Diversions for the Future Without and With the Proposed Action and the 85% Delaware CSSO Curve with 10/15 MGD Community Release ROP.....14-33

Figure 14.3-6. Flow Duration Curves at the Spillway Confluence, 1971–2017.....14-35

Figure 14.3-7. Streamflow at the Spillway Confluence14-35

Figure 14.3-8. Flood Magnitudes at Mount Marion for 2-Month to 100-Year Recurrence Intervals14-36

Figure 14.3-9. Occurrence and Average Magnitude of Various Release Types Between the Future With the Proposed Action and the Proposed ROP14-38

Figure 14.3-10. Occurrence of Release Turbidity Levels by Type of Year with the IRP14-39

Figure 14.3-11. Occurrence of Release Turbidity Levels by Type of Year with the ROP.....14-39

Figure 14.4-1. Monitoring Sites Along Lower Esopus Creek Included in the Water Quality Monitoring Plan Incorporated into the IRP 14-43

Figure 14.4-2. Proposed Monitoring Sites Along Lower Esopus Creek Included in the Proposed Revised Monitoring Plan 14-44

LIST OF TABLES

Table ES-1.	Valley Segments and Reaches of Lower Esopus Creek	ES-17
Table ES-2.	Lower Esopus Creek Watershed by Valley Reach Sub-watershed.....	ES-19
Table ES-3.	Median Contribution of Flows from Ashokan Reservoir to Lower Esopus Creek Background Streamflow in the Future With the Proposed Action	ES-23
Table ES-4.	Potential Environmental Considerations by Resource Area for Activities Associated with Dredging.....	ES-37
Table ES-5.	Summary of Alternatives Assessment	ES-40
Table ES-6.	Proposed Revised Release Protocol.....	ES-45
Table ES-7.	Proposed Revised Monitoring Plan	ES-46
Table 4-1.	Components of the Proposed Action Evaluated in the EIS	4-2
Table 4-2.	Infrastructure and Operational Assumptions in the EISS	4-2
Table 5.1-1.	OST Model Assumptions for the EIS	5-2
Table 5.2-1.	Emissions Scenarios Considered for the EIS	5-5
Table 5.2-2.	Observed Lower Esopus Creek Data Sources Used in the EIS	5-7
Table 5.2-3.	Hydrologic Inputs to Lower Esopus Creek Models.....	5-10
Table 5.3-1.	Summary of Questionnaire Distribution.....	5-29
Table 5.3-2.	Types of Aesthetic and Visual Resources Considered for Assessment	5-32
Table 6.1-1.	Valley Segments and Reaches of Lower Esopus Creek	6-2
Table 6.1-2.	Lower Esopus Creek Watershed by Valley Reach Sub-watershed.....	6-9
Table 6.2-1.	Median Contribution of Flows from Ashokan Reservoir to Lower Esopus Creek Background Streamflow in the Future with the Proposed Action	6-16
Table 7.1-1.	Magnitude and Duration of Spills in the Future Without and With the Proposed Action	7-3
Table 7.1-2.	Average Number of Days Per Year of Modeled Turbidity Levels of Flows between the Future Without and With the Proposed Action.....	7-9
Table 7.1-3.	Observed Average Water Temperatures in Ashokan Reservoir and Lower Esopus Creek by Season.....	7-22
Table 7.1-4.	Flood Frequency Estimates for the 100-year Recurrence Interval.....	7-28
Table 7.1-5.	FEMA FIS Summary of Discharges	7-28
Table 7.1-6.	Summary of Spills, Influent Turbidity Levels, and Ashokan Turbidity Levels for Alum Events (Observed)	7-30
Table 7.1-7.	Modeled Spills, Influent Turbidity Levels, and Ashokan Turbidity Levels for the Future Without and With the Proposed Action for Historical Alum Events	7-35
Table 7.1-8.	DEP Water Supply Reliability Metrics for the Future Without and Future With the Proposed Action Over the OST Simulation Period	7-47
Table 7.1-9.	Localized Factors Influencing Bank Retreat.....	7-78

Table 7.3-1.	Demographics within the 12 Census Tracts.....	7-104
Table 7.3-2.	Housing Stock Adjacent to Lower Esopus Creek by Type.....	7-106
Table 7.3-3.	Housing Prices Within the Study Area	7-107
Table 7.3-4.	Businesses Within the Study Area with the Potential to be Economically Dependent on Lower Esopus Creek.....	7-110
Table 7.3-5.	Average Annual Rate of Change in Nominal Market Value of a Single-Family Home.....	7-114
Table 7.3-6.	Summary of Resident Questionnaires Distributed and Received	7-115
Table 7.3-7.	Summary of Reported Seasonal Activity Days for Residents Adjacent to Lower Esopus Creek (n=105)	7-117
Table 7.3-8.	Summary of Expected Change in Residents' Participation in Recreational Activities Along Lower Esopus Creek Associated with Various Streamflow Water Quality and Conditions for Residents Adjacent to Lower Esopus Creek (n=105)	7-121
Table 7.3-9.	Summary of Business Questionnaires Distributed and Responses Received	7-124
Table 7.4-1.	Open Space and Recreational Resources in the Study Area.....	7-128
Table 7.4-2.	Days (On Average) Lower Esopus Creek Streamflow would be Above Specific Flows in July and August in the Future Without and With the Proposed Action.....	7-134
Table 7.4-3.	Expected Change in Days Respondents Would Participate in Fishing due to Lower Esopus Creek Conditions (n=97).....	7-137
Table 7.5-1.	Historic Resources Within the Study Area	7-140
Table 7.6-1.	Visual Resources Within the Study Area.....	7-155
Table 7.7-1.	Spatial and Temporal Distribution of Fish and Macroinvertebrate Sampling Stations.....	7-168
Table 7.7-2.	Richness and Biological Impact Assessment Scores, Stream Macroinvertebrate Sampling, 2009 to 2017	7-172
Table 7.7-3.	Presence/Absence of Fish Species Collected During Electrofishing Surveys	7-175
Table 7.7-4.	Presence/Absence of Fish Species Collected During Electrofishing Surveys	7-176
Table 7.7-5.	Suitable Turbidity Levels for Fish Species and Life Stages and Days Per Year Exceeded (Upstream of the Spillway Confluence).....	7-183
Table 7.7-6.	Suitable Turbidity Levels for Fish Species and Life Stages and Days Per Year Exceeded (Downstream of the Spillway Confluence)	7-187
Table 7.7-7.	HSI Matrix for Upstream, Future Without (No IRP) and Future With (IRP) the Proposed Action Hydrological Conditions (Wet, Normal and Dry Years)	7-191
Table 7.7-8.	HSI Matrix for Downstream, Future Without (No IRP) and Future With (IRP) the Proposed Action Hydrological Conditions (Wet, Normal and Dry Years).....	7-192
Table 7.8-1.	Summary of Delineated Wetlands Upstream of the Spillway Confluence	7-194
Table 7.8-2.	Summary of Dominant Wetland Vegetation Documented Upstream of the Spillway Confluence between 2006 and 2018.....	7-200

Table 7.8-3.	Summary of Delineated Wetlands Downstream of the Spillway Confluence	7-202
Table 7.8-4.	Summary of Dominant Wetland Vegetation Documented Downstream of the Spillway Confluence Between 2012 and 2018	7-203
Table 7.8-5.	Summary of Downed and Leaning Trees within the Floodplain Upstream of the Spillway Confluence (Valley Reach 1A).....	7-207
Table 7.9-1.	National Land Cover Data for the Lower Esopus Creek Study Area	7-212
Table 7.9-2.	Assessment of Threatened, Endangered, Special Concern, and Rare Species that Potentially Occur in the Study Area	7-219
Table 8.2-1.	Potential Environmental Considerations by Resource Area for Activities Associated with Dredging	8-6
Table 8.2-2.	Summary of Historical Alum Application Events from April 5, 2005 to Present	8-9
Table 8.2-3.	Estimated Total Sediment Volume	8-11
Table 8.2-4.	Construction Schedule	8-16
Table 8.3-1.	Kensico Reservoir Sampling Turbidity Results from January 1, 2017 to December 31, 2017	8-20
Table 8.3-2.	2017 TSS and Turbidity Summary Statistics for Kensico Watershed Streams N12 and N5-1.....	8-21
Table 8.3-3.	2016 Turbidity Summary Statistics for Kensico Reservoir Sampling Sites 4.1BRK and 5BRK	8-21
Table 8.3-4.	Benthic Invertebrates Collected and Identified During Sampling of 41 Locations at CATIC Cove in 2007 and 2014	8-31
Table 8.3-5.	Benthic Community Index Values for Samples Collected at CATIC Cove in 2007 and 2014.....	8-32
Table 8.3-6.	Fish Species Collected During NYSDEC Surveys of Kensico Reservoir	8-35
Table 8.3-7.	Breakdown of Cowardin Wetlands and Deepwater Habitats and Area within the Kensico Reservoir Study Area.....	8-48
Table 8.3-8.	Total Area by Cowardin Wetland and Deepwater Habitat Types within the Kensico Reservoir Study Area.....	8-49
Table 8.3-9.	National Land Cover Data for the Kensico Reservoir Study Area	8-53
Table 8.3-10.	Upland Vegetation Inventory Observed During 2014 and 2015 Site Visits.....	8-54
Table 8.3-11.	NYSDEC Monitored Concentrations of Criteria Air Pollutants in the Region	8-87
Table 14.1-1.	List of Alternatives Evaluated	14-2
Table 14.2-1.	Summary of Alternative Analysis.....	14-20
Table 14.3-1.	IRP Community Release Rules.....	14-24
Table 14.3-2.	Maximum Release Level Comparison.....	14-27
Table 14.3-3.	Maximum Release and Alum Days	14-28
Table 14.3-4.	IRP Turbidity Levels	14-28
Table 14.3-5.	ROP Turbidity Levels.....	14-29

Table 14.3-6. Probability of Refill14-31

Table 14.3-7. Stop Shutters, Shaft 4 and Percent Alum Days.....14-34

Table 14.4-1. Proposed Revised Monitoring Plan14-42

This page intentionally left blank

ACRONYMS

AQI – Air Quality Index
ARWG – Ashokan Release Working Group
AST – Aboveground Storage Tank
ATP – Alum Treatment Plan
BANCS – Bank Assessment for Non-Point Source Consequence of Sediment
BEHI – Bank Erosion Hazard Index
BGPA – Bald and Golden Eagle Protection Act
BMP – Best Management Practices
CATIC – Catskill Influent Chamber
CEA – Critical Environmental Areas
CEQR – City Environmental Quality Review
CF – Channel-forming
CFS – Cubic feet per second
CMP – Coastal Management Plan
CMZA – Coastal Management Zone Area
CRIS – Cultural Resource Information System
CSSO – Conditional Seasonal Storage Objective
CWA – Clean Water Act
cy – Cubic yards
CZMA – Coastal Zone Management Act
dB – Decibels
dB(A) – A-weighted Decibel Scale
dbh – Diameter at breast height
DEIS – Draft Environmental Impact Statement
DEM – Digital Elevation Model
DEP – New York City Department of Environmental Protection
EAB – Emerald Ash Borer
ECL – Environmental Conservation Law
EIS – Environmental Impact Statement
EPA – U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
EPT – Ephemeroptera/Plecoptera/Trichoptera
FAA – Federal Aviation Administration
FAD – Filtration Avoidance Determination

FEIS – Final Environmental Impact Statement
FEMA – Federal Emergency Management Agency
FFMP – Flexible Flow Management Plan
FIRM – Federal Insurance Rate Map
FIS – Flood Insurance Study
ft/s – Feet per second
GB – General business
GOSR – Governor's Office of Storm Recovery
gpm – Gallons per minute
HB – Highway Business
HBI – Hilsenhoff's Biotic Index
HC – Highway commercial
HDR – High-density residence
HRDC – Hudson River Tunnel Drainage Chamber
HSI – Habitat Suitability Indices
HUD – U.S. Department of Housing & Urban Development
IB – Inner Berm
IPaC – Information for Planning and Consultation
IQR – Interquartile Range
IRP – Interim Ashokan Release Protocol
JTU – Jackson Turbidity Units
KEC – Kensico-Eastview Connection
Ldn – Day-night average sound level
LEHD – Longitudinal Employer-Household Dynamics
LEWP – Lower Esopus Watershed Project
LWRP – Local Waterfront Revitalization Program
MBTA – Migratory Bird Treaty Act
MDR – Medium-density Residence
MGD – Million Gallons per Day
mg/kg – Milligrams per Kilogram
mg/L – Milligrams per Liter
MHI – Median Household Income
NAAQS – National Ambient Air Quality Standards
NALMS – North American Lake Management Society
NBS – Near-Bank Stress

NC – Neighborhood Commercial
NCO – Number of non-chironomid and oligochaetes taxa
NOAA – National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration
NRCS – Natural Resources Conservation Service
NTP – Notice to Proceed
NTU – Nephelometric Turbidity Units
NWI – National Wetland Inventory
NWS – National Weather Service
NY – New York
NYC – New York City
NYCRR – New York City Rules and Regulations
NYRCR – New York Rising Community Reconstruction
NYMA – New York Metropolitan Area
NYNHP – New York Natural Heritage Program
NYS – New York State
NYSDEC – New York State Department of Environmental Conservation
NYSDOH – New York State Department of Health
NYSDOS – New York State Department of State
NYSOPRHP – New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation
O&W – Ontario and Western
OLI – Office/Light Industrial
OM – Office Manufacturing
OST – Operations Support Tool
PEJ – Potential Environmental Justice
PPM – Part per Million
PW – Planned Waterfront
RI – Recurrence Interval
ROP – Revised Operating Protocol
RWBT – Rondout West Branch Tunnel
SAV – Submerged Aquatic Vegetation
SBU – Stream Biomonitoring Unit
SC – Silt-clay
SDWA – Safe Drinking Water Act
SEQRA – State Environmental Quality Review Act
SFHA – Special Flood Hazard Area

SHPO – State Historic Preservation Office
SPDES – State Pollutant Discharge Elimination System
sq mi – Square miles
SWTR – Surface Water Treatment Rules
TAGM – Technical and Administrative Guidance Memorandum
TSS – Total Suspended Solids (or Sediment)
µg/L – micrograms per liter
U.S. – United States
USACE – U.S. Army Corps of Engineers
UEC – Upper Effluent Chamber
USDA – U.S. Department of Agriculture
USFWS – U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
USGS – U.S. Geological Survey
UST – Underground Storage Tank
UV – Ultraviolet Light
WD – Waterfront Overlay District
WFF – Water for the Future
WFP – Water Filtration Plant
WWQMP – Watershed Water Quality Monitoring Plan